

MINUTES

MINUTES of MEETING of the STIRLING AND CLACKMANNANSHIRE CITY REGION DEAL JOINT COMMITTEE held via MS Teams on 26 JULY 2022 at 2.30 pm

Present

Councillor Ellen Forson, Clackmannanshire Council (In the Chair)
Councillor Martha Benny, Clackmannanshire Council
Graeme Duff, University of Stirling
Councillor Scott Farmer, Stirling Council
Councillor Chris Kane, Stirling Council,
Eileen Schofield, University of Stirling
Professor Leigh Sparks, University of Stirling

In Attendance

Betty Brown, Support Officer, Regional Project Management Office
Nikki Bridle, Chief Executive, Clackmannanshire Council
Jane Burrige, Lead Transformation Officer, Clackmannanshire Council
Councillor Denis Coyne, Clackmannanshire Council
John Craig, Programme Manager, University of Stirling
Martin Dalziel, Team Leader, External Communications, Stirling Council
Nicola Drago Ferrante, Growth Deal Programme Officer, University of Stirling
Graeme B. Forrester, Lead Solicitor – Governance, Stirling Council,
Emma Fyvie, Senior Manager – Development, Clackmannanshire Council
Ann Jacob-Chandler, Head of Regional Project Management Office
Pete Leonard, Strategic Director, Clackmannanshire Council
Steven MacDonald, Economic Growth, Culture, Tourism & Events, Stirling Council
Nicole McIntosh, Project Analyst, Regional Project Management Office
Paul Morris, Project Manager, Regional Project Management Office
Stuart Oliver, Senior Manager – Economic Development, Stirling Council
Carla MacFarlane, Communications, Clackmannanshire Council
Brian Roberts, Chief Operating Officer – Infrastructure and Environment, Stirling Council
Lee Robertson, Senior Manager, Legal & Governance, Clackmannanshire Council
Dr John Rogers, Executive Director, Research & Innovation Services, University of Stirling
William Rutherford, Finance Manager, Regional Project Management Office
Richard Marsh, Director, 4-Consulting
Gillian White, Committee Services, Clackmannanshire Council (Minutes)

CRD158 APOLOGIES AND SUBSTITUTIONS

Apologies were submitted on behalf of Councillor Kenneth Earle, Clackmannanshire Council, Carol Beattie, Chief Executive, Stirling Council; Dr John Rogers, University of Stirling; George Murphy, Interim Chief Finance Officer, Stirling Council; and Liam McCabe, Director of Finance, University of Stirling.

CRD159 DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST

None.

CRD160 URGENT BUSINESS

None.

CRD161 MINUTES – JOINT COMMITTEE MEETING – 22 MARCH 2022

The minutes of the meeting of the Stirling and Clackmannanshire City Region Deal Joint Committee held on 22 March 2022 were submitted for approval.

Decision

The minutes of the meeting of the Stirling and Clackmannanshire City Region Deal Joint Committee held on 22 March 2022 were agreed as an accurate record.

CRD162 FORWARD PLANNING**(a) JOINT COMMITTEE ROLLING ACTION LOG**

The Joint Committee Rolling Action Log was submitted for information. The log had been reviewed and updated to remove completed actions and provided comment on outstanding actions.

Decision

The Joint Committee agreed to note the content of the Rolling Action Log.

(b) JOINT COMMITTEE FORWARD PLAN

The Joint Committee Forward Plan was submitted for information.

Decision

The Joint Committee agreed to note the content of the Joint Committee Forward Plan.

CRD163 REVIEW OF STANDING ORDERS

The report, submitted by Graeme B. Forrester, Lead Solicitor – Governance, Stirling Council, sought amendment of the Stirling and Clackmannanshire City Region Deal Joint Committee Standing Orders (the “Standing Orders”) to reflect the change in makeup of Stirling Council following the recent local government elections.

Decision

The Joint Committee agreed to:-

1. Adopt the revised Standing Orders attached as appendix 1 with effect from 27 July 2022;
2. Note that Stirling Council will be asked to appoint members to the City Region Deal Joint Committee to maintain compliance with the revised Standing Orders; and
3. Note that a full review of the Standing Orders will be presented to the September 2022 meeting of the Stirling and Clackmannanshire City Region Deal Joint Committee.

Action

Regional Project Management Office/Governance

CRD164 STIRLING & CLACKMANNANSHIRE’S CITY REGION DEAL - PROGRAMME STATUS REPORT

The report, submitted by Ann Jacob-Chandler, Head of Regional Programme Management Office (RPMO) updated the Joint Committee on the deal programme highlights and progress overview.

The Chair particularly welcomed the work being undertaken around the Monitoring and Evaluation and Framework; and the news that the Deal is on track to meet the spending profile.

Decision

The Joint Committee agreed to:-

1. Note the content of the Programme Status Report.

CRD165 DIGITAL DISTRICT PHASE 2 (COWIE) – OUTLINE/FULL BUSINESS CASE

The report, submitted by Steven MacDonald, Economic Growth, Culture, Tourism & Events, Economic Development, Stirling Council sought Joint Committee approval of the Outline/Full Business Case for the Digital District Phase 2 (Cowie) Project. This project is part of the Regional Digital Hubs Programme of the City Region Deal.

The Chair reminded the Joint Committee that while governments may have a role in approving projects, it's the role of the Joint Committee to approve project business cases and also to have oversight of the implementation and monitoring of the project. She sought assurance that monitoring and evaluation would be completed for the Digital District Phase 2 in Cowie so that the Joint Committee can ensure outcomes are met or if not, the project is held to account. Steven MacDonald confirmed that a report will be brought back to the Joint Committee setting out the impacts from the monitoring and evaluation.

Decision

The Joint Committee agreed to:-

1. Approve the Outline/Full Business Case for the Digital District Phase 2 (Cowie), and;
2. Note the activity that has commenced as part of the project.

Action

Steven MacDonald, Economic Growth, Culture, Tourism & Events, Economic Development, Stirling Council

CRD166 THE JAPANESE GARDENS – BUSINESS JUSTIFICATION CASE

The report, submitted by Richard Marsh, Director at 4-Consulting, sought Joint Committee approval of the Business Justification Case for the Japanese Gardens Project. This project is part of the Capital Fund for Clackmannanshire within the City Region Deal.

The Chair commented that the Joint Committee needs to be very clear on what is expected from the project in return for funding. In relation to the four strategic outcomes of the City Region Deal - inclusive economic growth, higher value jobs, shared prosperity and an inclusive skills ecosystem; the report set out that this project doesn't deliver on these which is wholly unacceptable. This sets a dangerous precedent, because this is the first project in the deal that's going to be fully funded and on the ground delivering. It would undermine the Joint Committee's credibility and its inability to insist that future projects actually deliver what we're expecting them to. Every investment has to demonstrate its impact on the wider city region deal. The Chair would like to see a proper benefits realisation plan which delivers specifics and suggested that it could be that the garden will become an accredited living wage employer within three years; and it could demonstrate how they're going to widen the opportunities to include our most disadvantaged communities. The report set out that 90% of employees are female and live within the city region deal, but it would be good to know how many of them live within our most disadvantaged communities as it's difficult to see how that is being delivered here. The Chair also had concerns around how the garden promotes tourism across the city region area as it had been highlighted that the garden at the moment has four pictures of tourism things across the region, with one being in Falkirk which isn't within the city region deal. The Chair added that anyone who has visited the garden knows it's a special place and that it adds

a lot to Clackmannanshire but the Committee needs to be clear about what this deal is offering, not just to Clackmannanshire but the wider region

Councillor Martha Benny was in agreement and added the garden is absolutely fantastic, but she highlighted the need for everyone to benefit from the investment and to know that the same criteria is being set for all of the CRD projects and not making the Garden a special project because that would be wrong. Councillor Benny also explained how remote the garden at Cowden can be for those who do not drive.

Councillor Kane supported the Chair's position, but queried whether deferring consideration of the report would have any impact and how quickly the issues raised could be resolved.

Richard Marsh explained that the Japanese Garden was a smaller standalone project which didn't fit easily within a theme. The project was developed at risk but had been able to develop quickly, working with Clackmannanshire Works to provide employment opportunities for people who had lost their jobs during the pandemic, so there was a strong case for inclusive growth. He advised that because the monitoring and evaluation framework is evolving, he is keen to walk with the Joint Committee through that process. He raised a concern that while deferring a decision on the project to the next meeting, there would be no immediate impact on the project. However, he reminded the Joint committee that the project is being undertaken at financial risk and that still stands because the project has been funding through borrowing. It would be preferable if the Joint Committee could indicate that they were mindful to approve the project, but to identify what is required to give the Committee the confidence that the project is delivering the objectives required.

Councillor Farmer also supported the position of the Chair and re-iterated that it is all about consistency. That while the numbers of people that were projected to visit the Garden had been exceeded, there is not any sense of how it is contributing to community wealth building, inclusive growth or how people from disadvantaged backgrounds can access it or how they can develop skills or experience of work especially given the location's lack of connectivity. He also recognised the sensitivities around risk and financial exposure.

The Chair summed up stating that the Joint Committee appeared to be minded to approve the Business Justification Case for the Japanese Gardens subject to the receipt of further information, which would hopefully address the concerns rightfully expressed by the Joint Committee. This would take the form of a benefits realisation plan which would include: how does this project live up to the overall City Deal aims and objectives in terms of delivering benefit to those that are most excluded from the workplace or indeed from other activities within society; resolving connectivity issues around travelling to the location; how many people are able to access it for volunteering or employment opportunities and how this could be improved.

The Chair advised that she would expect to see that type of information made available for every single business case put forward to the Joint Committee.

Councillor Kane also asked that he would like to be clear what the Joint Committee is expecting to see back at the next meeting and requested that a note of what the Japanese Gardens are expected to provide are circulated amongst the Joint Committee for comment to ensure that there when the information is provided, there is nothing missing. The Chair agreed and asked if Richard Marsh could ensure that happens.

Action

Richard Marsh

Decision

The Joint Committee agreed to:-

1. Approve the Business Justification Case for the Japanese Gardens, subject to the inclusion of a “benefits realisation plan” being submitted for approval to the Joint Committee at the next meeting in September 2022;
2. Circulate the note of expectations from the Joint Committee, in terms of the benefits realisation plan, to ensure that the Japanese Gardens can provide the information requested ;
3. Note the activity that has commenced as part of the project.

Action

Pete Leonard, Strategic Director,Place

CRD167 POINT OF ORDER – COUNCILLOR FARMER

Councillor Farmer raised a point of order in that he had not been present during Item CRD163 - Review of Standing Orders, item due to technical difficulties. The Clerk advised, that having been unable to access the meeting for that period of time, Councillor Farmer could proceed to question and debate the report. Having had the opportunity to ask questions of the presenting officer, Councillor Farmer added his agreement to the report.

CRD168 CHANGE CONTROL PROCESS

The report, submitted by Nicole McIntosh, Project Analyst, RPMO, updated Joint Committee members on the requirement for a City Regional Deal Change Control Process to be submitted to and agreed with Governments and then implemented for use within the City Region Deal. This report also took into account feedback from Joint Committee on the previous version of this document.

Decision

Having considered the content of the Change Control Process, the Joint Committee agreed:-

1. To approve the Change Control Process to be implemented for use within the Stirling and Clackmannanshire City Region Deal.

Action

Ann Jacob-Chandler, Head of Regional Project Management Office

CRD169 BRANDING UPDATE AND ANNUAL REPORT FOR 2021

The report, submitted by Paul Morris, Project Manager, Regional Programme Management Office (RPMO) provided examples of potential City Region Deal branding and a logo to provide an identity for the Deal.

Since Deal signing there has been no clear and distinct corporate branding for the Deal. This has been managed within the Partnership up to now, however in keeping with the wider Deal landscape, there is an expectation for a specific brand identity for the Deal.

The RPMO has agreement from Government to delay publication of the 2021 Annual Report to allow for new branding to be applied. The RPMO is also engaged in developing a Deal level website for key documents and promotion of the wider Deal.

Following consultation within the Partnership, a tentative final version has been devised which is visible on the Annual Report, which is to be considered at this meeting. Production and publication of an Annual report on progress within the City Region Deal is a requirement of both Governments. It forms part of the annual conversation with Governments and is a public record of achievements within the Partnership.

Decision

The Joint Committee agreed to:-

1. Note the content of the report, and
2. Approve the revised logo option as appears on Annual Report.
3. Approve the Annual Report for 2021.

Action

Ann Jacob-Chandler, Head of Regional Project Management Office

CRD170 AOB**(a) FUTURE MEETING FORMATS**

The Joint Committee discussed options for returning to face-to-face meetings; moving to a hybrid option or remaining as virtual meetings via MS Teams.

Decision

The Joint Committee agreed that the meetings of the Joint Committee will remain as virtual meetings via MS Teams as the host Council's work towards the introduction of hybrid meetings. It was also agreed that this will be reviewed at each Joint Committee meeting.

Action

Clackmannanshire Council/Stirling Council

The Chair declared the meeting closed at 3.43 pm