

# MINUTE

## **MINUTES of MEETING of the STIRLING AND CLACKMANNANSHIRE CITY REGION DEAL JOINT COMMITTEE held via MS Teams on 17 December 2020 at 2.30 pm**

### **Present**

Councillor Ellen Forson (In the Chair)  
Councillor Martha Benny  
Councillor Kenneth Earle  
Councillor Neil Benny  
Councillor Scott Farmer  
Councillor Danny Gibson  
Ms Eileen Schofield

### **In Attendance**

Nikki Bridle, Chief Executive, Clackmannanshire Council  
Carol Beattie, Chief Executive, Stirling Council  
John Rodgers, Executive Director, Research and Innovation, University of Stirling  
Pete Leonard, Strategic Director (Place), Clackmannanshire Council  
Jim Boyle, Section 95 Officer  
Dave Hunt, Programme Management Officer, Clackmannanshire Council  
Bruce McLure, City Region Deal Programme Manager, Stirling Council  
Fiona Colligan, Head of Regional Programme Management Office, University of Stirling  
John Craig, City Region Deal Office, University of Stirling  
Councillor Donald Balsillie, Clackmannanshire Council  
Lindsay Thomson, Senior Manager, Legal and Governance, Clackmannanshire Council  
Gillian White, Committee Services, Legal and Governance, Clackmannanshire Council

### **CRD69 APOLOGIES AND SUBSTITUTIONS**

There were no apologies or substitutions.

### **CRD70 DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST**

There were no declarations of interest.

### **CRD71 MINUTES – 29 SEPTEMBER 2020**

The minutes of the meeting of the Stirling and Clackmannanshire City Region Deal Joint Committee held on 29 September 2020 were submitted for approval.

### Amendment to Minute Reference CRD67

Councillor Neil Benny advised that decision number 1 “The Joint Committee agreed to approve the Terms of Reference for the Programme Board” was inaccurate. The decision was that the Joint Committee agreed:

1. To consider and discuss the Terms of Reference for the Programme Board (appendix 1).

### Decision

Subject to the above amendment, the minutes of the meeting of the Stirling and Clackmannanshire City Region Deal Joint Committee held on 29 September 2020 were agreed as a correct record.

### CRD72 FORWARD PLANNING

#### (a) JOINT COMMITTEE WORK PROGRAMME

A list of items currently on the Joint Committee Work Programme was submitted for information.

Meeting Date	Item
TBC	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>o Implementation plan and financial profile</li> <li>o RPMO budget &amp; forward plan for approval</li> <li>o Chief Officers’ Group amendment to Terms of Reference and Membership</li> </ul>

John Rodgers updated the Joint Committee on the work undertaken on the development of the revised Implementation Plan and Financial Profile. The revised Plan and Profile were to be presented to the delegated group for consideration following the meeting of the Joint Committee. He advised that this revised Implementation Plan and Financial Profile will ultimately be presented to the Joint Committee for approval. He explained that because of the priority attached to that critical piece of work, which was necessary to secure the offer of grant, some of the other work had inevitably been delayed. The delegated group work programme has a number of outstanding inputs in terms of completing the other pieces of work and he anticipated bringing all outstanding items to the next meeting of the Joint Committee.

Eileen Schofield queried whether these outstanding items would come to the March 2021 Joint Committee meeting, or whether there is likely to be an additional meeting. John Rodgers confirmed that the expectation is that there would need to be a request made for a special meeting of Joint Committee in January 2021 as March would be too late.

## Decision

The Joint Committee agreed to:

1. Note the items on the Joint Committee Work Programme; and
2. Note that all outstanding items would be brought to a Special Meeting of the Joint Committee for approval in or around January 2021.

## Action

Fiona Colligan, Head of Programme Management Office, University of Stirling

### (b) JOINT COMMITTEE ROLLING ACTIONS LOG

The Joint Committee Rolling Action Log was submitted for information. The log had been made up of actions outstanding from previous minutes and members had the opportunity to question progress on the actions.

Councillor Neil Benny advised that the Joint Committee rolling action log seemed to be missing a number of expected completion dates and asked for an indication of when these dates can be provided. He also queried the number of Special Meetings held recently and suggested that the Joint Committee needs to consider the regularity of meetings.

John Rodgers explained that it had been exceptionally difficult to set and adhere to deadlines because of the continuing challenges and changes around Covid regulations and policy changes which had impacted on all partner organisations. He advised that these matters need to be brought to a conclusion in order to complete the offer of grant and that the rolling action log will be populated with a clear series of dates in discussion across the partnership and with the delegated group.

Eileen Schofield added that the Joint Committee had still not seen a plan in terms of the timeline for the submission of business cases; the finalisation of governance structures; completion of the tripartite agreement; and the arrangements for the substantive Regional Programme Management Office. She requested that the timeline is brought to the special meeting in January for consideration by the Joint Committee which may assist determination of the number of meetings of the Joint Committee that will be required.

## Decision

The Joint Committee agreed to:

1. Note the content of the Rolling Action Log;
2. Note that the Joint Committee Rolling Actions Log will be populated with a clear series of dates;
3. Note that a timeline for the submission of business cases; the finalisation of governance structures; completion of the tripartite agreement; and the arrangements for the substantive Regional Programme Management Office will be brought to the special meeting of the Joint Committee in January 2021 for consideration by the Joint Committee.

**Action**

Fiona Colligan, Head of Programme Management Office, University of Stirling

**CRD73 PROGRAMME OF JOINT COMMITTEE MEETINGS 2021/22**

Lindsay Thomson advised the Joint Committee that the draft programme reflected the requirement set out in Standing Orders to hold a meeting at least once every three months. The draft programme could be changed if the Joint Committee were minded to do so.

Councillor Neil Benny sought guidance from the PMO in terms of what would be an ideal frequency of meetings. Fiona Colligan confirmed that when looking at the work for Year 2 of the Deal, a case could be made for monthly meetings of the Joint Committee in order for the business cases to be able to flow through.

Councillor Neil Benny sought confirmation that Standing Orders state that while there is a requirement to hold a meeting a minimum of once every three months, the Joint Committee can meet more frequently without changing Standing Orders. Lindsay Thomson confirmed that the Standing Orders state a meeting must be held at least once every three months and in addition special meetings may be convened. Lindsay suggested in terms of pressure on everyone's diaries that there was a need for a planned approach and that perhaps changing the frequency may be the better approach taking into account need for meetings. This would be in compliance with the Standing Orders.

**Decision**

Following discussion, the Joint Committee agreed to:

1. Hold a Special Meeting of the Joint Committee in January 2021;
2. Submit a revised Programme of Joint Committee Meetings with monthly meetings for 2021/22 for approval by the Joint Committee at the Special Meeting in January 2021. CRD partners will be consulted in the drafting of the revised Programme to avoid existing meetings where possible.

The Chair also recognised that the role of Chair rotates back to Stirling Council in March 2021, but if dates are added to diaries, any changes can be made going forward.

**Action**

Lindsay Thomson, Senior Manager, Legal and Governance, Clackmannanshire Council

**CRD74 STIRLING AND CLACKMANNANSHIRE CITY REGION DEAL – CULTURE HERITAGE AND TOURISM PROGRAMME BOARD (CHTPB) - TERMS OF REFERENCE AND PROGRAMME BOARD**

The report by Stuart Oliver, Senior Manager Economic Development and Communities, Stirling Council, presented a Terms of Reference (ToR) for the City Region Deal Culture, Heritage and Tourism Programme Board for final sign off along with the proposed make-up of the Board.

During debate on the item, the following issues were raised and responded to:

- **Item 7 - Chairing the meetings (in the absence of the Chair)** – the ToR sets out that in the Chair’s absence, the chair would taken by VisitScotland, Historic Environment Scotland or Scottish Enterprise (in that order). However, further in the document is states “Vice Chair”. It was considered that in the Chair’s absence, the Vice Chair should take the chair and in the absence of both Chair and Vice Chair, then it should revert to VisitScotland, Historic Environment Scotland or Scottish Enterprise (in that order).
- **Appendix 2** – Steps in the Programme Business Case Development and Individual Project Selection. Concern was expressed that there is no mention of approval by the Joint Committee until the very last step in the process. Some members noted concern that it appears that the Scottish Government will get the opportunity for approval before the Joint Committee and that that may prove embarrassing if the COG and the Scottish Government were to approve something which the Joint Committee later reject. This concern was addressed in a discussion of the full business case journey.
- **Appendix 2** – concern was expressed that while there would be opportunities for negotiation between the Programme Board and the COG which then follows on for approval by the Scottish Government, this would potentially leave little time for the Joint Committee to make their decision before the critical deadline. There was also consideration of the interface between the Programme Board, COG and Scottish Government and the line of sight and approval process retained by Joint Committee.

These concerns were considered and responded to by Fiona Colligan as she described the full business case journey which is standard across all deals. Lindsay Thomson also responded in terms of the agreed terms of reference of the Joint Committee. It was accepted by officers that some of the governance steps that related to the COG and Programme Board would be developed in the future governance paper. Officers offered assurance that final approval for all business cases rested with joint committee. Fiona also advised that she had spoken to the COG regarding running some sessions on the business case journey to enable the Joint Committee to become more familiar with the process.

Nikki Bridle recognised the feedback from the Joint Committee and noted that the discussion had been a good lesson in making clear that there is oversight of the whole process that the business cases will follow.

Fiona Colligan advised that the Joint Committee will also be asked to approve the prioritisation matrix that will be applied by the Programme Board. This is the matrix that will be applied to assess the longlist of projects in order to create a shortlist which will then come forwards from the Programme Board to Joint Committee for approval.

### **Decision**

The Joint Committee agreed:

1. That the Terms of Reference for the Programme Board (Appendix 1) is updated to reflect that there will be a role of Vice Chair. This position will come into effect on the absence of the Chair and will be held by a representative of VisitScotland, Historic Environment Scotland or Scottish Enterprise (in that order).
2. That the Project Selection and Reporting Process (Appendix 2) is updated to reflect the full role and responsibilities of the Joint Committee in the process.
3. That the updated Terms of Reference and the Project Selection and Reporting Process (Appendix 2) will be submitted for final approval by the Joint Committee at the Special Meeting in January 2021.

### **Action**

Stuart Oliver, Senior Manager Economic Development and Communities, Stirling Council

*The Joint Committee resolved in terms of Section 50(a) of the Local Government (Scotland) Act, 1973, that discussion on Appendix 3 involved the likely disclosure of exempt information as detailed in Schedule 7A, Part 1, Paragraph 1. Therefore all staff not on the exempt distribution list were asked to withdraw from the meeting and the discussion took place in private session.*

**CRD75 STIRLING AND CLACKMANNANSHIRE CITY REGION DEAL – CULTURE HERITAGE AND TOURISM PROGRAMME BOARD (CHTPB) - TERMS OF REFERENCE AND PROGRAMME BOARD – APPENDIX 3**

Appendix 3, provided by Stuart Oliver, Senior Manager Economic Development and Communities, Stirling Council, presented the proposed make-up of the Programme Board and also highlighted the three potential chairs.

Stuart Oliver advised that Historic Environment Scotland has asked for a change of board member from David Mitchell to George Findlater who is the Head of Partnerships and Projects.

The Chair also confirmed that any decision on the appointment of a Chair of the Programme Board is a recommendation which has been endorsed by the Scottish Government.

**Decision**

The Joint Committee agreed:

1. That the position of Chair of the Culture, Heritage and Tourism Programme Board will be advertised.
2. A job description for the role of Chair of the Programme Board will be circulated by e-mail to members of the Joint Committee for approval to expedite the recruitment process.
3. Any prospective Chair will be asked to supply a Curriculum Vitae along with a brief statement of why they would like to be considered for the position and information on what they could bring to the role.
4. That the process of selection of the Chair will be that members of the Joint committee will propose a prospective Chair(s), which must then be seconded and subsequently voted on.
5. To note the impact the recruitment process for the role of Chair will have on the timescales set out in the milestones planner for the CHTPB.
6. To note that meetings of the Programme Board may be held prior to the Chair taking up their role.
7. That the Membership composition of the Programme Board and the Appointment of Chair will be submitted for final approval by the Joint Committee at the Special Meeting in January 2021.

**Action**

Stuart Oliver, Senior Manager Economic Development and Communities, Stirling Council

The Chair declared the Meeting closed at 3.51 pm.