
Report to Place Committee

Date of Meeting: 6 June 2019

Subject: Kerbside Glass Collection

Report by: Strategic Director (Place)

1.0 Purpose

- 1.1. This report reviews the options available for kerbside box recycling following the Place Convenor's Report to the meeting of Clackmannanshire Council on 18 April 2019.

2.0 Recommendations

- 2.1. It is recommended that the Committee:
- (a) note that the Council decided on 8 March 2018 to withdraw the kerbside box collection service
 - (b) agree that the provision of the service to residents qualifying for the Assisted Collection Service should now be retained (Option 2a) subject to Council approval as it partially reverses the previous Council decision, and
 - (c) note the announcement of the Scottish Government's Deposit Return Scheme and the subsequent requirement for a future review of service delivery.

3.0 Considerations

- 3.1. Agreement for Clackmannanshire Council to sign up to the Charter for Household Recycling was reached at Enterprise and Environment Committee on 19 May 2016.
- 3.2. At its meeting on 8 March 2018 Council decided to agree a saving amounting to £159,000 for the financial year 2018/19 to stop the Kerbside Box collection but to continue to provide a weekly food waste collection using purpose built vehicles. Additional glass banks would be provided in settlements and villages to complement existing provision and meet conditions of the Charter for Household Recycling (e.g. a bank to be available within 1km of all residential properties in urban areas). Other services would continue unchanged. £43,000 of this saving has been achieved to date leaving a further £116,000 outstanding.

- 3.3. This saving was one of a suite of policy savings totalling £2.931m agreed in order to allow the Council to set a balanced budget. The budget decisions were taken in accordance with the requirement to reduce expenditure and redesign service provision in the context of the need to ensure financial sustainability. It was also taken following extensive consultation including an on-line public survey, and seven public consultation events.
- 3.4. At its meeting on 18 April 2019, the Council instructed that that the roll out of the Kerbside Box collection service be delayed, to allow measures to be considered, primarily which take into account the needs of elderly people and those with disabilities.
- 3.5. The Council have historically performed well with regards to household recycling and composting. In the Local Government Benchmarking Framework 2017/18 Report, the Council ranked third in Scotland within this recycling category.
- 3.6. The Place Service has since undertaken an options appraisal of kerbside box collections services with cost implications summarised in Table 1.

Option	Summary	Cost	Comments
1	Proceed with planned service redesign	£18K	New baseline due to 10% estimate of bin contamination (additional landfill costs) from case study.
2a	Retain provision of kerbside box service for Assisted Collection Customers (provided externally)	£45k	The £18k baseline costs would be partially mitigated by income from glass collection and reduced contamination (est. £9k). In addition, contractor costs are estimated at £36k.
2b	Retain provision of kerbside box service for Assisted Collection Customers (provided internally)	£73k*	Revenue operational costs £73k *plus additional capital cost of £145k in year 2/3 for replacement vehicle.
3	Retain kerbside box glass collection for all residents in urban areas on a reduced frequency	£89k	No revenue saving but income received from glass
4	Permit all residents to dispose of glass in their blue recycling bins	£146k	Cost of disposing of all recyclates would increase and cost of glass disposal would increase significantly

Table 1

3.7. Consideration of options:-

a) **Option 1:-** Proceed with service redesign as planned:-

- This complies with the Code of Practice for Household Recycling in Scotland and retains glass recycling facilities within Clackmannanshire.
- The existing Assisted Collection Service is available to residents that are elderly, have a medical condition or a disability and are unable to present their waste and recycling containers to the designated collection point. This Option does not include continuing the assisted collection service for kerbside box collection.
- Community feedback indicates some public concern regarding the Council decision to withdraw the Kerbside Box collection service, primarily the impact upon elderly people and those with disabilities and concerns over an increase in fly tipping.
- A significant number of Local Authorities collect glass through recycling points only, including Fife and Perth & Kinross. None offer additional support to help assisted collection customers transport their glass to them.
- Inverclyde Council have recently ceased the provision of their Kerbside Box collection service, without offering additional support to aid residents receiving assisted collections. This change was successfully implemented with contamination rates (disposing of glass in other bins) reported at less than 10%.
- The assisted collection service would be retained for all other waste streams (including green bins, blue bins and brown bins).

b) **Option 2:-** Retain provision of full kerbside box service for residents who are eligible for the Assisted Collection Service (with reduced collection frequencies):-

- The Service currently provides the Assisted Collection Service to around 1,500 households. 1,100 of these properties are signed up specifically for food waste and kerbside box collection. Presentation of kerbside boxes from assisted collection households is estimated at around 40% (600 properties).
 - **Option 2a)** - Retaining a kerbside box collection service to these households at a reduced frequency (four weekly) is achievable using an external contractor (subject to market testing) at additional cost.
 - **Option 2b)** - An in-house kerbside box collection service (for this Group) could be provided but would require two additional posts. This would also provide additional capacity within the Service to assist with other likely demand pressures. The additional vehicle/crew associated with retaining an in-house service would require an additional £229k spend over the first three years.

- Provision of this service would likely lead to an increase in applications for scheme membership which will require to be reviewed going forward.
 - This option addresses our communities primary concern in ensuring a sustainable collection service is retained for those residents who are unable to access the communal recycling facilities.
- c) **Option 3:-** Retain kerbside box glass collection for all residents in urban areas (not textiles or WEEE), in combination with food waste collections, on a reduced frequency
- A kerbside collection service for food and glass waste (both fortnightly) could be retained (utilising current resources).
 - The agreed saving from removal of kerbside box collection would not be achieved due to increased staffing requirements.
 - Fortnightly separated food collection is contrary to best practice guidance produced by Zero Waste Scotland and the Waste Resources Action Programme (WRAP). Evidence from trials suggest weekly food collection frequencies outperform fortnightly frequencies, in terms of participation and capture rate, in some cases by almost 50%.
 - This option would remove the risk of residual (green bin) collections being affected by glass contamination.
- d) **Option 4:-** Permit all residents to dispose of glass in their blue recycling bins:-
- Permitting residents to dispose of glass waste in their blue recycling bins contravenes the guidance within the Charter for Household Recycling.
 - The cost of recycling this waste (due to the tonnages of glass) would significantly exceed the value of Kerbside Box saving.
 - The adoption of this collection / disposal method would limit the number of companies able to handle our recycling waste, subsequently presenting financial risk at tender.
- 3.8. The risk of additional fly tipping resulting from this change in service provision is not considered significant. There are concerns that the new communal glass bin sites could be abused. The Service will introduce a maintenance regime on all 'bring sites' and work with our contractors involved in the glass collection, to ensure these areas are retained in a reasonable condition. This action will be supported by an awareness campaign on our website.
- 3.9. The Scottish Government's Deposit Return Scheme was announced on the 8 May 2019. Legislation will be introduced later this year, after the Scottish Parliament approves the necessary regulations. The Deposit Return Scheme will have an impact on container (glass, plastic and metal) arisings in Local Authority collections. The Code of Practice will be reviewed in light of this, however the timescale is unknown. This Scheme may have a significant effect on a number of Council waste collection streams.

- 3.10. The implementation of the Deposit Return Scheme will be at least 12 months after the legislation is enacted. A further review of service provision will be required once further details are available.
- 3.11. Removal of the Kerbside Box service risks a number of households disposing of glass waste in residual waste (green) bins. These changes create a risk of glass contamination (additional tonnage) affecting the residual waste collection stream. However, this risk is mitigated by the benchmarking data which highlights how well Clackmannanshire's residents have embraced recycling. This is supported by the low contamination rates from the Inverclyde case study. Inverclyde is in the same Local Government Benchmarking Framework Family Group as Clackmannanshire, hence is a comparable area which was also in the top quartile for household recycling and composting in 2017/18.

4.0 Sustainability Implications

- 4.1. The proposals set out in the report will retain positive impacts on the environment and economic sustainability of the community.

5.0 Resource Implications

5.1. *Financial Details*

- 5.2. The recommended option 2(a) would result in an estimated £45k reduction in the previously approved saving which will require to be managed across the wider service during the financial year.

5.3. *Staffing*

- 5.4. There are no direct staff reduction implications (excluding agency staff) arising from this report.

6.0 Exempt Reports

- 6.1. Is this report exempt? Yes (please detail the reasons for exemption below) No

7.0 Declarations

The recommendations contained within this report support or implement our Corporate Priorities and Council Policies.

- (1) **Our Priorities** (Please double click on the check box)

Clackmannanshire will be attractive to businesses & people and ensure fair opportunities for all	√
Our families; children and young people will have the best possible start in life	<input type="checkbox"/>
Women and girls will be confident and aspirational, and achieve their full potential	<input type="checkbox"/>
Our communities will be resilient and empowered so	

that they can thrive and flourish

✓

(2) **Council Policies** (Please detail)

8.0 Equalities Impact

8.1 Have you undertaken the required equalities impact assessment to ensure that no groups are adversely affected by the recommendations?

Yes ✓

9.0 Legality

9.1 It has been confirmed that in adopting the recommendations contained in this report, the Council is acting within its legal powers.

Yes ✓

10.0 Appendices

10.1 A map of recycling points will be circulated at the Committee meeting.

11.0 Background Papers

11.1 Have you used other documents to compile your report? (All documents must be kept available by the author for public inspection for four years from the date of meeting at which the report is considered) Yes ✓ (please list the documents below)

Household Recycling Charter -

<https://www.zerowastescotland.org.uk/content/charter-household-recycling>

Deposit Return Scheme Government Consultation

<https://consult.gov.scot/environment-forestry/deposit-return-scheme/>

Blue Box Kerbside Collection report to Council of 18 April 2019

Author(s)

NAME	DESIGNATION	TEL NO / EXTENSION
Scott Walker	Team Leader	Extension : 2612

Approved by

NAME	DESIGNATION	SIGNATURE
Garry Dallas	Strategic Director (Place)	
Nikki Bridle	Chief Executive	