
Report to: People Committee

Date of Meeting: 1 November 2108

Subject: St Mungo's Roman Catholic Primary School

Report by: Jane Rough, Improving Outcomes Manager

1.0 Purpose

- 1.1 Provide an update on the issues associated with the water ingress at St Mungo's RCPS school building.
- 1.2 Advise members of the outcomes of the two reports that the Council commissioned.

2.0 Recommendations

It is recommended that the People Committee:

- 2.1 Notes that St Mungo's RCPS was decanted to Alloa Academy in April 2018, as a result of concerns about the ongoing issue with damp.
- 2.2 Notes the cost of carrying out the remedial work is estimated at between £1.7m and £1.9m.
- 2.3 Agrees that the remedial work should not be undertaken at the school
- 2.4 Agrees that St Mungo's RCPS should remain in Alloa Academy for the medium term until the longer term plans have been fully developed and consulted on

3.0 Considerations

- 3.1 There has been an ongoing issue with damp at St Mungo's RCPS. Inspections were undertaken and remedial work carried out, but the damp smell remained and water levels under the floor continued to rise. Parts of the floor were damaged and a decision was made earlier this year to decant the school to a self contained designated area on the 1st floor of Alloa Academy as a precautionary measure. This ensures that children and staff are in a safe and healthy environment and allowed intrusive investigative works to be carried out.
- 3.2 Alloa Academy was chosen as it has sufficient space to accommodate all the children of St Mungo's RCPS, no other school has the capacity to keep the St Mungo's RCPS community together. In addition, the majority of children attending the school live

within walking distance of Alloa Academy. These parents and children continue to be able to walk to school.

- 3.3 Since the decant we have made St Mungo's RCPS secure, carried out inspections of the building and monitored the surrounding grounds.
- 3.4 We commissioned 2 external reports to advise the Council on possible options. The first report, received at the end of June, described the current condition of the property and provided an understanding of the current condition of the property and to provide advice relating to repairs. The report estimated that the cost of undertaking these repairs amounts to between £1.6m and £1.8m. Amongst other things, this includes replacing the floor, the heating system and all pipework.
- 3.5 Following receipt of this report, a drainage investigation report was commissioned to examine the issue of water gathering in the foundations of the school. This report was received at the end of August and highlighted the complex groundwater conditions prevailing in the area. The report said that it is difficult to identify a specific feature that is likely to be responsible for the water entering the site.
- 3.6 Officers from the Council's assets team have interpreted the reports and provided a briefing to the Education Service on the findings, a copy of which is contained in Appendix 2. The reports do not provide guarantees that the cost of the repairs can be limited to £1.8million, or that the dampness would not return in the future.
- 3.7 Since the decant, the Headteachers of Alloa Academy and St Mungo's have been working together with Senior Managers of the Council to ensure we are meeting the needs of all our children and young people. Senior Officers met with the St Mungo's Parent Council between April and June as we waited for the commissioned reports to come back. .
- 3.8 Senior Officers met with members of both parent councils, elected members and representatives of the Catholic Church on 27 September. The technical briefing was shared, which informed the discussions. At that meeting, parents expressed concerns about operational matters such a school toilets, lunch time arrangements and school grounds. These have now been reviewed and changes have been put in place and a development plan is being taken forward for the school grounds. Regular meetings have been arranged between the chairs from both parent councils and officers of the Council, including the two headteachers, to maintain an ongoing dialogue with parents. Following that meeting parents of both schools were issued with a letter containing "frequently asked questions" and answers, this is attached as Appendix 1.

4.0 Financial Implications

- 4.1 There are no implications relating to the PPP contract associated with locating St Mungo's RCPS Primary in Alloa Academy

5.0 Sustainability Implications

- 5.1 The paper has no sustainability implications.

6.0 Resource Implications

6.1 No

7.0 Exempt Reports

7.1 No

8.0 Declarations

8.1 The recommendations contained within this report support or implement our Corporate Priorities and Council Policies.

(1) **Our Priorities** (Please double click on the check box)

Clackmannanshire will be attractive to businesses & people and ensure fair opportunities for all

Our families; children and young people will have the best possible start in life

Women and girls will be confident and aspirational, and achieve their full potential

Our communities will be resilient and empowered so that they can thrive and flourish

The Council is effective, efficient and recognised for excellence

(2) **Council Policies** (Please detail)

Not applicable.

9.0 Equalities Impact

9.1 Have you undertaken the required equalities impact assessment to ensure that no groups are adversely affected by the recommendations?

Yes

10.0 Legality

10.1 It has been confirmed that in adopting the recommendations contained in this report, the council is acting within its legal powers.

The Schools (Consultation) (Scotland) Act 2010 requires an education authority to undertake a consultation before it implements a relevant proposal which it has formulated. The Act sets out what proposals are relevant proposals and require consultation. One of the proposals is to relocate a school. St Mungo's was decanted to Alloa Academy due to concerns that the impact the damp conditions in the school would have on the health of children and staff and to allow detailed investigative work to be undertaken. The recommendations in this paper represent a holding position. It is not intended to relocate St Mungos to Alloa Academy permanently, indeed the focus of the Councils' work in the last few months has been ascertaining the position in relation to the existing building. The Council will consult in accordance with the Act if there are any relevant proposals it wishes to pursue in future.

11.0 Appendices

- 11.1 Appendix 1 Frequently asked questions
- 11.2 Appendix 2 Technical briefing
- 11.3 Appendix 3 Action plan


12.0 Background Papers

- 12.1 'Condition Survey report of St Mungo's School': Hardies Property & Construction Consultants June 2018
- 12.2 'St Mungos School Assessment of Groundwater Flooding Susceptibility' WSP August 2018

Author(s)

NAME	DESIGNATION	TEL NO / EXTENSION
Anne M Pearson	Chief Education Officer	01259 452438

Approved by

NAME	DESIGNATION	SIGNATURE
Anne Pearson	Chief Education Officer	
Stuart Crickmar	Strategic Director Partnership & Performance	

Appendix 1

St Mungo's Roman Catholic Primary Schools Frequently asked questions August 2018

St Mungo's FAQs

Q1. Why was St Mungo's decanted to Alloa Academy?

A1. There has been an ongoing issue with damp at St Mungo's RC Primary for some time. Inspections have been made and remedial work carried out, but the damp smell remained, areas of the floor were damaged.

Water levels under the floor continued to rise so a decision was made earlier this year to decant the school to a self contained designated area on the 1st floor of Alloa Academy as a precautionary measure. This ensures that children and staff are in a safe and healthy environment and has allowed intrusive investigative works to be carried out.

Q2. Why to Alloa Academy?

A2. Alloa Academy had sufficient space (it has capacity for 900 pupils) to accommodate all the children of St Mungo's.

No other school in the Council had the capacity to keep the St Mungo's community together. In addition, the majority of children attending St Mungo's RCPS live within walking distance of Alloa Academy. These parents and children continue to be able to walk to school.

Q3. What has the Council done since the decant in April?

A3. We made St Mungo's RCPS secure, carried out inspections of the building and monitored the surrounding grounds.

We commissioned 2 external reports to advise the Council on options.

We received a report at the end of June. The purpose of the report was to gain an understanding of the current condition of the property and to provide advice relating to repairs that affect the fabric and structural integrity of the property. For the first time this quantified the cost of undertaking repairs, which amounts to nearly £2m. This includes replacing the floor, the heating system and all pipework.

Following receipt of this report we decided to undertake a drainage investigation to examine the issue of water gathering in the foundations of the school. This report was received at the end of August.

Q4. Has there been any consultation with parents?

A4. There is the opportunity for ongoing discussion between HTs and their Parent Councils. Senior Officers have met with the Parent Council between April and June whilst we waited for the commissioned reports to come back.

Acting on feedback from parents we have reviewed lunchtime arrangements and use of toilet facilities. Additional staff hours have been allocated to the school to ensure greater supervision in the playground at lunchtime.

Following receipt of both reports at the end of August a joint meeting of the Parent Councils of Alloa Academy and St Mungo's, elected members and senior officers was arranged for Thursday 27th September. The purpose of this meeting is to share the content of the reports and to discuss next steps.

Q5. What does 'medium term' mean?

A5. Based on the experience at Tullibody South at least 3 years:

Q6. Will the repairs be carried out?

A6. In the report to People Committee on 1 November, Officers will recommend that the repairs are not undertaken and the school remains in the Alloa Academy site

Q7. Will you rebuild the school on another site?

A7. As part of a report on the Education Estate to be brought before Clackmannanshire Council, officers will recommend that subject to budget availability and Government funding, an Alloa South East Campus should be constructed which will incorporate a number of schools and nurseries and community facilities. It is the intention that St Mungo's Primary would be part of this campus.

Q8. What happens next?

A8. The Council is committed to the children and families of both Alloa Academy and St Mungo's RCPS and the long term future of St Mungo's.

Officers will bring forward a report to the People Committee at the beginning of November recommending that St Mungo's RCPS will remain located in Alloa Academy in the medium term.

Q9. How will this impact on my child's learning (both St Mungo's and Alloa Academy pupils)?

A9. The Headteachers and staff at both schools are committed to ensuring that pupils' learning is not disrupted. Ongoing changes are risk assessed by teaching staff.

The 2 HTs are going to explore how the excellent facilities at Alloa Academy can be used to enrich the children's educational experience

Q10. I've still got questions – who do I speak to?

A10. First of all speak to your Headteacher.

Appendix 2

Technical Briefing on St Mungo's external reports

Comments on Hardies Report. – June 2018

In essence, the report confirms that there is a severe damp problem within the school building and this will require a package of measures to address this.

The Hardies report confirms the findings of our in-house surveys carried out in October 2017. Remedial costs to attempt to address the issues found are estimated being in the region £1.78M. The report does not provide an elemental cost breakdown, instead uses a standard refurbishment rate of £1,360 per m², plus a further £300K for the tanking works. The total cost of this equates to £1.78m.

The key findings of the report are -

- **There is a damp problem due to water in the solum area. This is a complex problem and the report recommend tanking and solum upgrade (£300K) to address the problems .However Given the proposed works to the solum area, these cannot be undertaken in isolation. The minimum cost of the upgrade is estimated at £1.78m including associated works connected to this. There will be no guarantee given the unstable ground conditions that this investment will indeed address the problem fully.**
- **The flat roof covering is at the end of its economic life and requires replacement.**
- **The pitched roof may have a life expectancy of approximately 10 to 15 years, although localised repairs are required**
- **Aside from the ground water ingress, the property is in “good to fair condition for its age”.**
- **The external fabric of the property is in good order, with only minor defects noted to the wall structure**

The report further highlights that upgrades to the solum area will also require the following associated works -

- replacement of all floor linings and coverings

- renewal of all skirting, facings and internal door sets
- renewal of all fixtures and fittings secured to the floor including
- upgrading of the toilet facilities and kitchen including extraction systems
- renewal of the electrical installation, including the fire alarm and IT/teaching infrastructure
- renewal of the heating installation
- Internal redecoration throughout
- renewal of the flat roof covering, including rooflights
- Renewal of the roof tiling to pitched roof, including rainwater goods.
- Replacement roller shutters, and redecoration of the security bars to the windows.

The windows and doors to the property are in good condition and do not require to be replaced.

Ground Survey – WSP – September 2018 – Comments/Findings

- There are complex groundwater conditions prevailing in the area so clear drivers re the issues at the school are difficult to determine
- Clay deposits within the sub-soil ground are evident in the area and therefore this hinders rainfall infiltration to the ground, thereby increasing pluvial (surface water) flood risk.
- Recent developments have caused changes to the groundwater environment and it is suggested this could have influenced water table rise in the area of the school
- The changes referred to are described as :- topographic changes and resultant potential for extra groundwater recharge ; increased SUDs discharge and associated earthworks ; altered drainage features. Comment is made that the adverse ground water effect on the school could be as a result of a combination of these factors

Potential mitigations listed are :-

- A sufficiently deep and long filter drain along the toe of the development earth bund to the south / east of the school with this filter drain then linked to the river Black Devon in some manner.
- An interception drain to the north of the school to provide protection from that direction.

Action note St Mungo's/Alloa Academy working group

10 October 2018

No	Action/Discussion	When	Comment – New actions
1.	Report to People Committee on 1 st November 2018 regarding the recommendations that St Mungo's RCPS should remain in Alloa Academy in the medium term	1/11/18	1. Copy to be sent to Chairs as soon as possible prior to committee 2. Confirm with parents that People committee is open to the public
2.	The Parent Councils requested copies of the recent reports and the previous reports from 2014 as background	23/10/18	completed
3.	Working groups to be established with both Parent Councils	On-going	First meeting. Decision to arrange an officers and parents group to take forward the actions agreed.
4.	Working in partnership officers and parent chairs should meet to establish an action plan and communication strategy.	5/10/18	Timetable of monthly meetings to be sent out with meetings taking place in the first few months this can be reviewed. Attendees <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • IOM • HTs • 2 parents from each parent Council • Service Manager Assets • H&S • Soft FM/catering • IT • And any other officer required can be invited to tasks forward
5.	An action plan and timeline to be established to address issues raised. These include: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Metal work at the bottom of the trees should be covered this could be by furniture round the tree; • Playground to be improved. • Acknowledged that trim trail will not be moved due to possible health and safety issues; • Children's access to suitable toilets; 		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Asset manager to be asked to take forward request for signs and "furniture" around bottom trees • Playground plan to be drawn up • HT to continue to monitor

	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Further risk assessment of climbing wall; • St Mungo's health and safety/risk assessment to be shared with parent council. 		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Risk Assessment shared
6.	<p>A public announcement to be made that St Mungo's is not closing.</p> <p>Support to be given to the school to ensure the school roll is maintained.</p>	1/11/18	Press release to be issued at time of Committee report
7.	A request was made for a mosaic to be displayed on the front of the school building.	As soon as possible	<p>As this is a PPP school any changes need to be agreed with Clackmannanshire Schools Education Partnership (CSEP).</p> <p>Asset Manager asked to find out more details</p>
8.	St Mungo's to have access to halls within the school for fund raising events	Agreed	<p>Agreement has been reached on the use of the school hall.</p> <p>More discussion to take place between HTS</p>
9.	Pupil voice to be heard for both St Mungo's and Alloa Academy pupils	30/11/18	HTs taking forward
10.	FAQ to be issued to parents	5/10/18	Complete

Timetable of meetings

Future meetings
14/11/18
12/12/18
16/01/19
13/02/19
13/03/19
17/04/19