

Technical Options Appraisal Report



St. John's Primary School, Alloa
Claremont Primary School, Alloa



F M Services
JANUARY 2011
(AMENDED MARCH 2011)



**Clackmannanshire
Council**

www.clacksweb.org.uk



Fairbairns
Construction Consultants
Chartered Quantity Surveyors

CONTENTS

	Page No.
1.0 INTRODUCTION	1
2.0 BACKGROUND	2
3.0 PROPOSALS	4
4.0 LIFE CYCLE COST SUMMARY	12

APPENDICES

- 1. ST JOHN'S BUILDING INSPECTION REPORT**
- 2. CRA LTD REPORT: ST JOHN'S**
- 3. CLAREMONT BUILDING INSPECTION REPORT**
- 4. CRA LTD REPORT: CLAREMONT**
- 5. FAIRBAIRNS: OPTIONS APPRAISAL INDICATIVE COSTS**
- 6. FM SERVICES: LIFE CYCLE COST ANALYSIS**
- 7. FM SERVICES: OPTION 2- 290 PUPIL INDICATIVE COSTS
AND LIFE CYCLE COST ANALYSIS**

1.0 INTRODUCTION

- 1.1 This report has been prepared by Clackmannanshire Council Facilities Management Services (FM Services) with additional supporting information provided by Fairbairn's, Chartered Surveyors and CRA Ltd, Structural Engineers. It provides background information for the proposal to merge St John's and Claremont Primary Schools in a new school. Financial implications of the various options are set out in the including reference to full life cycle costs where appropriate.
- 1.2 This report discusses the technical options only with passing reference to general suitability in particular to access for the disabled. Educational issues, including suitability, are set out in the main Committee report which this document supports.
- 1.3 The main options are as follows:
- Option A: Do nothing/minimum to the existing schools.
 - Option B: Refurbishment of St John's Primary School on the existing site.
 - Option C: New build of St John's on existing site.
 - Option D: Refurbish and extend Claremont Primary School to accommodate all of St John's pupils.
 - Option E: Build a new school to serve the combined catchment areas of St John's and Claremont at Claremont.
 - Option F: Build a new school to serve the combined catchment areas of St John's and Claremont at Redwell.
 - Option G: Alter and extend existing offices to form new school to serve the combined catchment areas of St John's and Claremont at the Pavilions, Alloa West.
 - Option H: Closure of St John's with absorption of its catchment area into the adjacent catchment zones and the construction of four additional classrooms at Park Primary School.
 - Option I: New build of St John's on Redwell site. (420 or 290 pupils)
- 1.4 The report contains location maps, detailed condition reports which formed the basis of the refurbishment and upgrading costs with detailed costs for each of the above options including the costs of furniture fixtures and fittings and interactive whiteboards. A 30 year discounted cost analysis is set out for each of the options including upgrading, running and maintenance costs.
- 1.5 It should be noted that Option C is impossible to achieve since the site does not meet the minimum requirements for a Primary School as set out in the 1967 School Premises (General Requirements and Standards)(Scotland) Regulations. There are no detailed costs against this option and we recommend its removal.

2.0 BACKGROUND

2.1 St John's Primary School

- 2.1.1 St John's Primary School is situated to the north end of Grange Road in Alloa. The original building was constructed c.1908-9 by local architects Kerr & McCulloch in the Art Nouveau style and is Category B listed. It is a symmetrical block with two storeys and a basement, constructed with red sandstone with various pitched and slated roofs, intermediate flat roofs and roof ventilators.
- 2.1.2 The school was extended in 1939 with the addition of the gym hall and associated accommodation constructed in brick with a flat roof. A further classroom extension was added c.1960 with ground and lower ground floors constructed in brick and concrete with pitched and slated roof. The nursery accommodation was formed from basement accommodation in 1999.
- 2.1.3 This building appears to be at the end of its serviceable life. Considerable investment is required to refurbish the school for the medium term. This will not, however, address inherent existing suitability deficiencies.
- 2.1.4 The roofs and cast iron rain water goods in particular are in bad condition and require to be replaced in their entirety in the short term. The external and internal decoration is deteriorated and also requires attention in the short term.
- 2.1.5 The external stone walls generally require to be repointed with some localised repairs to weathered stones and a chimney.
- 2.1.6 The windows and external doors require to be overhauled or replaced. There is an outstanding issue where PVCu windows have been installed in the Category B listed 1908 building and these may have to be replaced with timber sash and case units to match the original windows.
- 2.1.7 A programme of internal and external decoration is required and consideration should be given to installing suspended ceilings and new lighting to the classrooms.
- 2.1.8 The heating system is inefficient and requires to be completely replaced.

2.2 Claremont Primary School

- 2.2.1 Purpose built primary school c.1966 situated towards the western edge of Alloa on a sloping site extending to approximately 0.81 hectares (2.0 acres). The building is concrete framed with flat roofs, cavity brick walls and a roughcast finish. A timber frame extension was added c.1999 to the northwest corner of the school to form an additional infant classroom. There is a detached steel framed two classroom modular building situated to the north east of the main building.
- 2.2.2 This building is borderline between satisfactory and poor condition. While some upgrading of ceilings and lighting has been undertaken recently further improvements are required.
- 2.2.3 Externally the roughcast continues to be prone to cracking and spalling and further repairs are required. The PVCu cladding requires to be cleaned and repaired. The macadam surfaces are generally weathered and worn and require to be resurfaced. It is likely that the roof coverings will require to be replaced in the short to medium term. Consideration should be given to installing a new pitched roof over the whole building.
- 2.2.4 The electric heating is costly to run and consideration should be given to installing gas fired central heating.
- 2.2.5 The building is not fully accessible and while a full access audit was not carried out the following matters should be noted:
- There is no dedicated parking bay for the disabled.
 - The main entrance is inaccessible and it is not possible to pass from the lower ground floor to the main assembly hall without going outside the building. Two wheelchair platform lifts accommodate the changes in level to the main ground floor. There is no internal lift serving the lower ground floor.

3.0 PROPOSALS

3.1 Option A: Do nothing / minimum to St John's and Claremont.



© Crown Copyright and database right 2010. All rights reserved. Ordnance Survey Licence number 100020783.

Claremont PS, Carse Terrace



St John's PS, Grange Road.

- 3.1.1 This option would maintain the status quo by retaining the existing buildings however there would be no betterment of existing facilities.
- 3.1.2 For St John's in particular this option is not sustainable as the building requires significant works in the short term. The roof coverings require to be renewed, the stonework needs significant attention and the heating system is obsolete and inefficient. Any major failure of the fabric or services would have a significant knock-on effect on the ability of FM Services to maintain the rest of the non-housing property portfolio. There will also remain inherent existing suitability and access deficiencies.
- 3.1.3 Claremont is less likely to face significant failure of the building fabric although the flat roof covering will require replacement in the short to medium term and may leak more frequently as the covering deteriorates further. The electric heating system would remain in operation despite being costly and inefficient. The various inherent access barriers and difficulties will also remain for the disabled.

3.2 Option B (This is Option 1 in the consultation paper): Refurbishment of St John's Primary School on the existing site.



© Crown Copyright and database right 2010. All rights reserved.
Ordnance Survey Licence number 100020783.

3.2.1 This option would maintain the status quo by refurbishing the existing however there would be no betterment of existing facilities. Included in the refurbishment works is the renewal of the original internal cast iron down pipes and drains. A lift would have to be installed and the top floor of the original building would require to be made compliant with current health and safety regulations and Building Standards subject to listed building consent. The addition of external fire escape stairs are also required to enable the best use of the first floor accommodation.

3.2.2 The school would have to be decanted into temporary classrooms set up in the West End Park or in the playground. Leasing arrangements and servicing temporary classrooms would have costs of around £220,000 per annum assuming that half the school can remain in the building whilst the refurbishment is done. The refurbishment process is likely to be protracted and could be disruptive to pupils' education.

3.2.3 Initial cost estimates for refurbishment of St John's are in excess of £2.86m however this is not in the current capital programme. There is no capital receipt associated with this option. The life cycle costs are shown in the table below:

3.2.4

<u>Lifecycle costs</u>	£
Cost of Works	2,868,376
Furniture & Equipment	150,000
Gross Capital Costs	3,018,376
SFT Grant funded	-
Net Capital Cost	3,018,376
Net Cost/(Saving) 30 Years	4,978,376
Capital Receipts	0
Total Cost/(Saving) 30 Years	4,978,376
Total Cost/(Saving) Per Year	165,946

3.3 Option C: New Build of St John's on its existing school site



© Crown Copyright and database right 2010. All rights reserved.
Ordnance Survey Licence number 100020783.

- 3.3.1 This option is not at all viable as the site does not meet the minimum requirements for a Primary School as set out in the 1967 School Premises (General Requirements and Standards)(Scotland) Regulations.
- 3.3.2 The existing playground is not large enough to accommodate the footprint of a new school. The school grounds are not large enough for a two stream primary school. The school would need to be decanted whilst the building is demolished and a new one constructed. The demolition of the Category B listed part of the building would require the permission of Historic Scotland and this may not be granted. Currently, the Council does not own suitable decant accommodation for the school and so expense would be incurred in this option before any build takes place.

3.4 Option D (This is Option 3 in the consultation paper): Refurbish and extend Claremont Primary School to accommodate all of St John's pupils.



© Crown Copyright and database right 2010. All rights reserved.
Ordnance Survey Licence number 100020783.

3.4.1 The school has limited grounds due to a steeply sloping site which would be reduced further by the extension of the school to provide a gym hall and additional classrooms and other accommodation. The current library is housed in temporary hired modular accommodation and would require to be integrated within the school. Road access to the school is poor as is the current disabled access in and around the school. Car parking is very limited, refurbishment is likely to be protracted and there would be a need for a decant facility. An initial cost for refurbishing Claremont would be £4,253,620 and the life cycle costs are shown in the table below:

3.4.2

<u>Lifecycle costs</u>	£
Cost of Works	4,253,620
Furniture & Equipment	175,000
Gross Capital Costs	4,428,620
SFT Grant funded	-
Net Capital Cost	4,428,620
Net Cost/(Saving) 30 Years*	2,689,112
Capital Receipts	(350,000)
Total Cost/(Saving) 30 Years	2,339,112
Total Cost/(Saving) Per Year	77,970

*based on estimated running costs of a new school.

3.5 Option E: Build a new school to serve the combined catchment areas of St John's and Claremont at Claremont / Old Alloa Academy Site .



© Crown Copyright and database right 2010. All rights reserved.
Ordnance Survey Licence number 100020783.

3.5.1 The projected roll for a new school would be 420 pupils. A new building would be constructed to the north of the site with a new access directly from Claremont. Once completed the old building would be demolished and new terraced playground and playing field formed. The cost for this proposal is estimated at £8,197,200. The life cycle costs are shown in the table below:

3.5.2

<u>Lifecycle costs</u>	<u>£</u>
Cost of Works	8,197,200
Furniture & Equipment	200,000
Gross Capital Costs	8,397,200
SFT Grant funded	(4,053,750)
Net Capital Cost	4,343,450
Net Cost/(Saving) 30 Years*	823,535
Capital Receipts	(350,000)
Total Cost/(Saving) 30 Years	473,535
Total Cost/(Saving) Per Year	15,784

*based on estimated running costs of a new school.

3.6 Option F (This is Option 4 in the consultation paper): Build a new school to serve the combined catchment areas of St John's and Claremont at Redwell.



© Crown Copyright and database right 2010. All rights reserved.
Ordnance Survey Licence number 100020783.

3.6.1 A new school could be built on the Redwell site and would incorporate facilities for the community use of the playing fields. The construction of a new school here would not disrupt learning and there should be no need for a decant facility to be found.

3.6.2 The cost of a new building on the Redwell site is estimated at £8,441,334. An estimated capital receipt of £1,100,000 from the two existing sites would be expected and funding from the SFT has been offered. The life cycle costs are shown in the table below:

3.6.3

<u>Lifecycle costs</u>	<u>£</u>
Cost of Works	8,536,374
Furniture & Equipment	200,000
Gross Capital Costs	8,736,374
SFT Grant funded	(4,053,750)
Net Capital Cost	4,682,624
Net Cost/(Saving) 30 Years*	1,553,363
Capital Receipts	(1,100,000)
Total Cost/(Saving) 30 Years	453,363
Total Cost/(Saving) Per Year	15,112

*based on estimated running costs of a new school.

3.7 Option G: Alter and extend existing unoccupied offices to form a new school to serve the combined catchment areas of St John's and Claremont at the Pavilions, Alloa West.



© Crown Copyright and database right 2010. All rights reserved.
Ordnance Survey Licence number 100020783.

3.7.1 A new school could be created from the existing Phase II unoccupied office block at The Pavilions. The existing block can be altered to provide teaching accommodation and an extension can be added to provide a hall and ancillary accommodation. The construction of a new school here would not disrupt learning and there should be no need for a decant facility to be found. It would potentially take less time to establish the school given that much of the drainage, services and roads infrastructure as well as most of the building envelope have already been constructed.

3.7.2 The cost of establishing a new school at The Pavilions is estimated at £5,124,438. An estimated capital receipt of £1,100 000 from the two existing sites would be expected and grant funding from the Scottish Futures Trust would be available. The site is part-owned by the Council and there are early indications that the joint venture partner would be willing to negotiate a buy-out. The cost of any buy-out and other associated costs has been excluded from this report at this stage and would not be supported by grant funding by the Scottish Futures Trust. The life cycle costs are shown in the table below:

3.7.3

<u>Lifecycle costs</u>	£
Cost of Works	5,124,438
Furniture & Equipment	200,000
Gross Capital Costs	5,324,438
SFT Grant funded (50%)	(2,562,219)
Net Capital Cost	2,762,219
Net Cost/(Saving) 30 Years*	(1,983,536)
Capital Receipts	(1,100,000)
Total Cost/(Saving) 30 Years	(3,083,536)
Total Cost/(Saving) Per Year	(102,785)

*based on estimated running costs of a new school.

3.8 Option H: Closure of St John's with absorption of its catchment area into the adjacent catchment zones and the construction of four additional classrooms at Park Primary School.



© Crown Copyright and database right 2010. All rights reserved.
Ordnance Survey Licence number 100020783.

- 3.8.1 This options makes the assumption that pupils currently in St John's would transfer to Park Primary School. This is merely to illustrate the impact on property costs for comparison with the other options. The exact distribution of pupils from St John's cannot be determined until the consultation process is concluded and revised catchment zones are agreed.
- 3.8.2 Park Primary is under occupied and would have the capacity to absorb St John's pupils with minimal additional works. Land is available around the school and so it would be possible to accommodate an additional four classrooms.
- 3.8.3 The cost of the four additional classrooms is estimated at £945,392 and the life cycle costs are shown in the table below:

3.8.4

<u>Lifecycle costs</u>	<u>£</u>
Cost of Works	945,392
Furniture & Equipment	40,000
Gross Capital Costs	985,392
SFT Grant funded	-
Net Capital Cost	985,392
Net Cost/(Saving) 30 Years	(4,838,836)
Capital Receipts	(350,000)
Total Cost/(Saving) 30 Years	(5,188,836)
Total Cost/(Saving) Per Year	(172,961)

3.9 Option I (Option 2): Build a new St John's school at Redwell. (420 or 290 Pupils).



© Crown Copyright and database right 2010. All rights reserved.
Ordnance Survey Licence number 100020783.

3.9.1 A new school could be built on the Redwell site and would incorporate facilities for the community use of the playing fields. The construction of a new school here would not disrupt learning and there should be no need for a decant facility to be found.

3.9.2 Two sizes of school are shown for comparison including two stream (420 pupils), 290 pupils which is a similar capacity to current school building and single stream (210 pupils). It should be noted that the single stream would not be large enough to accommodate the current school roll. The SFT funding for the 290 and 210 pupil size is estimated by FM Services using the basic funding formulae but has yet to be verified and confirmed by the Scottish Government. The cost of a new building on the Redwell site at these three sizes along with their estimated life cycle costs are shown in the table below:

3.9.3

	420 Pupils	290 Pupils	210 Pupils
<u>Lifecycle costs</u>	£	£	£
Cost of Works	8,536,374	7,900,000	7,610,000
Furniture & Equipment	200,000	180,000	160,000
Gross Capital Costs	8,736,374	8,080,000	7,770,000
SFT Grant funded	(4,053,750)	(2,900,000)	(2,097,000)
Net Capital Cost	4,682,624	5,180,000	5,673,000
Net Cost/(Saving) 30 Years*	7,532,979	8,004,797	9,525,133
Capital Receipts	(350,000)	(350,000)	(350,000)
Total Cost/(Saving) 30 Years	7,182,979	7,654,797	9,175,133
Total Cost/(Saving) Per Year	239,433	255,160	305,838

*based on estimated running costs of a new school.

4.0 Life Cycle Cost Summary for all options**4.1 Life Cycle Cost Summary table.**

OPTION	CONSULTATION OPTION	Net Capital Cost of Works (£)	Net Cost/ (Saving) 30 Years (£)	Capital Receipts (£)	Total Cost/ (Saving) 30 Years (£)	Total Cost/ (Saving) Per Year (£)
A		No costs calculated as option is not viable or sustainable.				
B	1	3,018,376	4,978,376	-	4,978,376	165,946
C		No costs calculated as option is not viable.				
D	3	4,428,620	2,689,112	(350,000)	2,339,112	77,970
E		4,343,450	823,535	(350,000)	473,535	15,784
F	4	4,682,624	1,553,363	(1,100,000)	453,363	15,112
G		2,762,219	(1,983,536)	(1,100,000)	(3,083,536)	(102,785)
H		985,392	(4,838,836)	(350,000)	(5,188,836)	(172,961)
I (420)	2	4,682,624	(4,053,750)	(350,000)	7,182,979	239,433
I (290)	2	5,180,000	(2,900,000)	(350,000)	7,654,797	255,160
I (210)	2	5,673,000	(2,097,000)	(350,000)	9,175,133	305,838

4.1.1 The Net Capital Costs above represent the capital sum to be borrowed over 30 years for each option. Options A and C do not have detailed costs for the reasons given in 3.1 and 3.3 above as they are not fundamentally viable. Option B is also not considered viable on the basis that it will not address fully the inherent suitability deficiencies of the building and site.

4.1.2 Option D would cause major disruption to Claremont pupils and staff while the existing building is altered and extended. The resulting school building may not have the same benefits of a completely new building being restricted by the existing building envelope and its split level design. It is not clear at the time of writing this report whether grant funding of up to 50% would be available from the Scottish Futures Trust for this particular project.

4.1.3 Option E provides a new school building at Claremont for only a marginal cost increase of just £16k per annum overall. The Council foregoes a potential capital

receipt by retaining the site. Grant assistance is likely to be made available from the Scottish Futures Trust to a maximum of £4,053,750.

- 4.1.4 Option F provides a new school building at Redwell for only a marginal cost increase estimated at £15k per annum overall. This can be constructed without disrupting pupils and staff at St John's or Claremont and would provide an improved facilities and teaching environment for all. Grant assistance is likely to be made available from the Scottish Futures Trust to a maximum of £4,053,750.
- 4.1.5 Option G will provide a new school for the lowest capital investment for construction costs and yet offers significant savings of £103k per annum or £3.08m over 30 years. The Scottish Futures Trust have indicated that they may be prepared to fund up to 50% of the cost of the building works subject to more detailed examination of the proposals. This option requires a bit more background investigation since it already involves a joint-venture partner. It is likely that any buy-out and associated costs could be met from the balance of the capital sum already set aside by the Council for providing a new school at Alloa West.
- 4.1.6 Option H makes the assumption that pupils from St John's will transfer to Park Primary School. This is by no means a certainty and the exact redistribution of pupils from St John's cannot be determined until the consultation process is concluded and revised catchment zones are agreed. However this does provide the biggest savings on property costs for the least capital investment. It does not, however, allow the opportunity for 400 or so pupils to enjoy the benefits of a new building designed to meet the requirements of today's curriculum.
- 4.1.7 Option I shows the costs of a 420, 290 or a 210 pupil school to replace the existing St John's on the Redwell site. The funding element for the 290 and 210 pupil capacity school is estimated at this stage and subject to confirmation by the Scottish Government. The net capital cost to the council for a 290 or a 210 pupil school is approximately £500k and £1m more, respectively, than for the 420 pupil building.