
Report to: Clackmannanshire Council

Date of Meeting: 11 August 2016

Subject: Outcome of Consultation on Tullibody South Campus Development

Report by: Chief Education Officer

1.0 Purpose

- 1.1. This report provides information on the outcome of the formal consultation on the Tullibody South Campus comprising of the new build relocated St Bernadette's and the new build Abercromby.
- 1.2. It seeks Council approval on the location of the new Abercromby and St Bernadette's campus and authority for officers to progress the project as set out in this report.

2.0 Recommendations

It is recommended that the Council:

- 2.1.1. agrees to the construction of a Tullibody South Campus, incorporating a new build of Abercromby PS and a relocation and new build of St Bernadette's PS within the grounds of Abercromby Primary school (Option A),
- 2.1.2. subject to approval of 2.1.1, agrees to declare the existing St Bernadette's PS as surplus to requirements and
- 2.1.3. notes that a further report will be brought to Council in January 2017 providing information on the outcome of the further stakeholder engagement, and outlining design proposals.

3.0 Considerations

3.1. Background

- 3.1.1. At the Council meeting on 4 February 2016, the Council approved consultation on two options for the location of Tullibody South Campus.

Option A

The Campus be located within the grounds of the present Abercromby Primary School.

Option B

The Campus be located within the grounds of the present Tullibody Civic Centre.

As both options involved the relocation of St Bernadette's RC Primary school and Option B also included the relocation of Abercromby Primary school, the consultation required to be a formal consultation under the Schools Consultation (Scotland) Act 2010 and focused on the educational benefits of either proposal.

- 3.1.2 Following the Council decision on 4 February, the Council undertook a formal consultation on the preferred site for the new Tullibody South Campus.
- 3.1.3 Copies of the consultation document were distributed to all parents and staff at the two schools and Abercromby Nursery. Copies were also made available locally within Tullibody as well as the Speirs Centre and at the Council headquarters in Kilncraigs.
- 3.1.4 In addition, the consultation document was emailed to 190 users of the Tullibody Civic Centre. The document was also sent to Community Planning Partners, Community Councils and the constituency MSP. The Roman Catholic Diocese of Dunkeld and the parishioners of St Bernadette's in Tullibody and St John Vianney in Alva were also consulted.
- 3.1.5 Consultation meetings were held with the staff in both schools and the parent Councils. Pupils were also consulted using the principles contained within the "Participants not Pawns" guidance provided by the Children and Young People Commission for Scotland.
- 3.1.6 In addition to the meetings with the Parent Councils of both schools and pupils, officers attended a consultation event organised by the Catholic Church in St Bernadette's RC church.
- 3.1.7 As required by the Act, two formal consultation events were held to which Education Scotland were invited and proceedings of the meetings were recorded verbatim and a transcript was published. These recordings took place on 15 March, 2016 in St Bernadette's RC Primary School and 22 March, 2016 in Abercromby Primary School. 58 people attended the meeting in St Bernadette's RC Primary School and 42 attended the meeting in Abercromby Primary School.

3.2 Outcome of the consultation

- 3.2.1 Copies of feedback forms were made available at the meetings and respondents were also encouraged to respond via Clackmannanshire Council's online consultation database Citizen Space.
- 3.2.2 434 responses were received, both online and in paper. 81.3% of respondents supported the creation of a campus and 17.7% did not.
- 3.2.3 79% of respondents said they preferred the present Abercromby site and 11% the Civic Centre site, with a further 10% not expressing any view.
- 3.2.4 412 responses were submitted by pupils at both schools. 299 (73%) of the pupils supported the concept of a Tullibody campus with 113 (27%) against.
- 3.2.5 353 pupils submitted responses to the preferred site of the new campus, of 231 (65%) of whom expressed a preference for it to be built within the grounds of Abercromby Primary and 122 (35%) on the Civic Centre site.
- 3.2.6 The consultation also gave people an opportunity to respond to a range of open-ended questions; these responses are set out in Appendix 2.

3.3 Education Scotland report

- 3.3.1 As part of the statutory consultation, officers from Education Scotland attended one of the public meetings and visited both schools. Following this they prepared a report on the consultation which is contained on Appendix 1.
- 3.3.2 The summary of the report by Education Scotland concludes that the proposal to relocate educational provision at Abercromby Primary school and St Bernadette's RC Primary school to a new campus, on the most appropriate site has "clear educational benefits". The proposal has the potential to provide a high quality learning environment. The report also recommends that the Council should fully involve stakeholders including the Diocese of Dunkeld and community groups in the design process of the new accommodation.

3.4 Response from Diocese of Dunkeld

- 3.4.1 As the proposal involved formal relocation of St Bernadette's PS, a formal response was provided by the Roman Catholic Diocese of Dunkeld. The church indicated that it would support the creation of a joint campus provided that the Council involved the church in the consultation over the detailed design of the new school and that the design conditions laid down by the Bishops of Scotland for shared campuses be followed.

3.4.2 It is recommended that the Council engage with key stakeholders, including the Diocese of Dunkeld, to progress outline design of the new campus on the site of Abercromby Primary school grounds, and that a further report be brought back to Council in January 2017 providing further information on the outcome of the stakeholder engagement, and sets out final design proposals.

3.5 Further Stakeholder Engagement

3.5.1 Further Stakeholder Engagement will take place in Autumn 2016 in order to address the issues outlined at 3.16. Officers will bring back a report to Council in January 2017 providing information on the outcome of this engagement, and outline design proposals

3.5.2 It is anticipated construction would commence in Autumn 17.

4 Sustainability Implications

4.1 The creation of a new campus will allow the school to move from an existing energy inefficient building to be a modern efficient building.

5.0 Resource Implications

5.1 The estimated cost of the recommended option is £15.35m (as set out in report to special Council meeting of 4 February, 2016). Funding of £5.35m has been secured through the Scottish Government Schools for the Future fund. Clackmannanshire Council agreed as part of its budget in February 2016 to allocate £11.25m for the project.

5.2 The full financial implications of the recommendations are set out in the report. This includes a reference to the full life cycle costs where appropriate. Yes ✓

5.4 Finance have been consulted and have agreed the financial implications as set out in the report Yes ✓

5.5 Consultations will take place with Trade Unions over any staffing implications of creating the campus.

6.0 Exempt Reports

6.1 Is this report exempt? Yes (please detail the reasons for exemption below) No ✓

7.0 Declarations

The recommendations contained within this report support or implement our Corporate Priorities and Council Policies.

(1) **Our Priorities** (Please double click on the check box)

- The area has a positive image and attracts people and businesses ✓
- Our communities are more cohesive and inclusive ✓
- People are better skilled, trained and ready for learning and employment ✓
- Our communities are safer ✓
- Vulnerable people and families are supported ✓
- Substance misuse and its effects are reduced ✓
- Health is improving and health inequalities are reducing ✓
- The environment is protected and enhanced for all ✓
- The Council is effective, efficient and recognised for excellence ✓

(2) **Council Policies** (Please detail)

Our schoolchildren are successful learners

8.0 Equalities Impact

8.1 Have you undertaken the required equalities impact assessment to ensure that no groups are adversely affected by the recommendations?

Yes No

9.0 Legality

9.1 It has been confirmed that in adopting the recommendations contained in this report, the Council is acting within its legal powers. Yes

10.0 Appendices

10.1 Appendix 1 Report by Education Scotland

10.2 Appendix 2 – Consultation Report on The Creation of a Tullibody South Campus June 2016

11.0 Background Papers

11.1 Have you used other documents to compile your report? (All documents must be kept available by the author for public inspection for four years from the date of meeting at which the report is considered)

Yes (please list the documents below) No

Consultation report on the Creation of Tullibody South Campus June 2016

4 February 2016, Proposed Tullibody South Campus Development



10 September 2014, Consultation Process for Tullibody South Proposal

23 April 2015, Consultation Process for Tullibody South Proposal

Author(s)

NAME	DESIGNATION	TEL NO / EXTENSION
Michael Boyle	Service Manager	01786 233215

Approved by

NAME	DESIGNATION	SIGNATURE
Anne Pearson	Chief Education Officer	
Garry Dallas	Executive Director	

Report by Education Scotland addressing educational aspects of the proposal by Clackmannanshire Council to relocate education provision at Abercromby Primary School and St Bernadette's RC Primary School to a new campus in Tullibody South and to consult on the most appropriate site for the campus.

1. Introduction

This report from Education Scotland has been prepared by HM Inspectors in accordance with the terms of the *Schools (Consultation) (Scotland) Act 2010* and the amendments contained in the *Children and Young People (Scotland) Act 2014*. The purpose of the report is to provide an independent and impartial consideration of Clackmannanshire Council's proposal to relocate education provision at Abercromby Primary School and St Bernadette's RC Primary School to a new campus in Tullibody South and to consult on the most appropriate site for the campus. Section 2 of the report sets out brief details of the consultation process. Section 3 of the report sets out HM Inspectors' consideration of the educational aspects of the proposal, including significant views expressed by consultees. Section 4 summarises HM Inspectors' overall view of the proposal. Upon receipt of this report, the Act requires the council to consider it and then prepare its final consultation report. The council's final consultation report should include a copy of this report and must contain an explanation of how, in finalising the proposal, it has reviewed the initial proposal, including a summary of points raised during the consultation process and the council's response to them. The council has to publish its final consultation report three weeks before it takes its final decision. Where a council is proposing to close a school, it needs to follow all legislative obligations set out in the 2010 Act, including notifying Ministers within six working days of making its final decision and explaining to consultees the opportunity they have to make representations to Ministers.

1.1 HM Inspectors considered:

- the likely effects of the proposal for children and young people of the schools; any other users; children likely to become pupils within two years of the date of publication of the proposal paper; and other children and young people in the council area;
- any other likely effects of the proposal;
- how the council intends to minimise or avoid any adverse effects that may arise from the proposal; and
- the educational benefits the council believes will result from implementation of the proposal, and the council's reasons for coming to these beliefs.

1.2 In preparing this report, HM Inspectors undertook the following activities:

- attendance at the public meeting held on 15 March 2016 in connection with the council's proposals;

- consideration of all relevant documentation provided by the council in relation to the proposal, specifically the educational benefits statement and related consultation documents, written and oral submissions from parents and others; and
- visits to the site of Abercromby Primary School and Nursery Class and St Bernadette's RC Primary School, including discussion with relevant consultees.

2. Consultation Process

2.1 Clackmannanshire Council undertook the consultation on its proposal with reference to the *Schools (Consultation) (Scotland) Act 2010* and the amendments in the *Children and Young People (Scotland) Act 2014*.

2.2 Clackmannanshire Council undertook an informal consultation from 12 May to 3 July 2015 on three options in relation to a campus for Tullibody South. The analysis of responses led to the proposal to develop a campus incorporating Abercromby Primary School and Nursery Class, St Bernadette's RC Primary School and a Locality Hub which would integrate existing public services onto one site. Two alternative site options emerged from the informal consultation. Option A: a new Tullibody South Campus within the grounds of the present Abercromby Primary School and Option B: a new Tullibody South campus located within the grounds of the present Tullibody Civic Centre.

2.3 The statutory consultation ran from 22 February to 22 April 2016. Notices about the proposal were placed on the council's website and copies of the proposal were widely available to stakeholders. Children attending Abercromby and St Bernadette's RC Primary Schools were given good opportunities to give their views. As part of its consultation arrangements the council held public meetings on 15 March 2016 in St Bernadette's RC Primary School and 22 March 2016 in Abercromby Primary School.

2.4 The council received 438 responses to its proposal of which 81.8% were in favour of a Tullibody South Campus. In response to the question regarding which site option they preferred, 81.3% of those who responded were in favour of Option A, 10.8% preferred Option B and 10.3% chose not to answer the question.

2.5 The written submission from the Diocese of Dunkeld indicated that in principle it would support the creation of a joint campus provided the council adhered to the conditions and assurances laid down by the Bishops Conference of Scotland.

3. Educational Aspects of Proposal

3.1 This proposal offers clear educational benefits for the children of Tullibody South. As a result of the proposal, children will have access to modern school buildings which offer a range of flexible learning spaces and fully equipped to deliver Curriculum for Excellence. The council's proposal will ensure each school retains its own separate identity while offering many opportunities to work and learn together on the one campus. It will be easier for staff from both schools to work together and

to use these opportunities to develop further the curriculum and learning. The proposal has the potential to strengthen community links which already exist between the schools, the church and the various groups which access the Tullibody Civic Centre and Heritage Centre.

3.2 Most of the stakeholders who met with HM Inspectors supported the proposal and agreed that the children needed more modern school accommodation and improved outdoor sporting facilities. Almost all children who met with HM Inspectors viewed the proposal positively. They were keen to help design a new school that would include a large outdoor space where they could play and take part in a wider range of outdoor activities.

3.3 The few stakeholders who oppose the proposal were more focused on the possible loss of a community resource and were seeking assurance from the council that community groups and the Heritage Centre would be protected should the proposal go ahead. In taking this proposal forward the council should reassure stakeholders that it will, as outlined in the consultation documentation, involve them fully in the design and other aspects of the development of the campus.

4. Summary

Clackmannanshire Council's proposal to relocate educational provision at Abercromby Primary School and St Bernadette's RC Primary School to a new campus in Tullibody South on the most appropriate site has clear educational benefits. The proposal has the potential to provide the children with a high-quality learning environment. In taking this proposal forward, the council should continue, as planned, to fully involve all stakeholders, including the Diocese of Dunkeld and community groups, in the design process for the new school accommodation.

**HM Inspectors
Education Scotland
April 2016**

Making Clackmannanshire Better

Consultation report on



The Creation of a Tullibody South Campus

June 2016

Better Services

Better Opportunities

Better Communities



**Clackmannanshire
Council**

www.clacksweb.org.uk

Contents

Purpose of this Consultation_____ 4

List of Consultees and Methodology _____ 4

Responses to the Consultation_____ 5

Public Consultation – Submissions _____ 6

Report by Education Scotland _____ 13

Next stages _____ 15

Purpose of this Consultation

We are consulting on the relocation of education provision at Abercromby Primary School and St Bernadette's Primary School to a new campus in Tullibody South. We are also consulting on the most appropriate site for the campus. The feedback obtained from this consultation will inform the Council's decision on both the creation and site of the new Tullibody South Campus.

List of Consultees and Methodology

As part of the public consultation, the Education Authority consulted with pupils, parents and staff.

In addition to the above, the following bodies were also consulted in writing.

Roman Catholic Diocese of Dunkeld

St Bernadette's Parish

St John Vianney Parish

Abercromby Parent Council

St Bernadette's Parent Council

EIS

Unison

Tullibody Cambus and Glenochil Community Council

Menstrie Community Council

Alva Community Council

Police Scotland

Fire Scotland

NHS Forth Valley

Constituency MSP

Members of the communities of Tullibody and surrounding area.

Methodology

Pupil Consultation

Pupils from both schools across all year stages were consulted on whether they were in favour of a new community campus, and their preference over the location of a campus. This was undertaken by staff from who have substantial experience in seeking the views of children. The consultation took place after the spring holiday break and involved visits to both schools. The pupil consultation followed the principles contained within "Participants not Pawns." Which is the guidance provided by the Children and Young People's Commissioner for Scotland on consulting with young people. In addition pupils had previously participated in workshop sessions as part of the informal consultation.

Parent Consultation

All parents received a copy of the consultation document. This was provided both as a printed copy and also by a text message with a link to the documentation on Clackmannanshire Council's website. Meetings were held with both parent councils prior to the public meetings, offering parents the opportunity to hear about the consultation process and ask any questions. A number of parents attended both the parent council meetings and subsequent public meetings.

Staff Consultation

Copies of the consultation document were provided to all staff in both schools. A meeting was organised specifically for staff to allow them the opportunity to ask any questions of the Head of Education and officers from the Education service prior to the public meeting. These were held at the end of the school day with all teaching and support staff being invited. Copies of the consultation document were also sent to representative unions Clackmannanshire Council Branch Officials.

Community Consultation

As the proposal includes the proposal to integrate community facilities into the new Tullibody South Campus, a substantial amount of wider community consultation was undertaken. Copies of the consultation document were made available at Clackmannanshire Council Headquarters, the Speirs Centre, Abercromby Primary School, St Bernadette's RC Primary School and at Tullibody Civic Centre. In addition, the consultation document was emailed to 190 users of the Tullibody Civic Centre.

Schedule of Meetings

St Bernadette's Parents Council Briefing 7th March
Parish Meeting (St Bernadettes & St John Vianney Parishes) 9th March 2016
St Bernadette's Staff Meeting 15th March 2016
St Bernadette's Public Meeting 15th March 2016
Abercromby Parent Council 16th March 2016
Abercromby Staff Meeting 22nd March 2016
Abercromby Public Meeting 22nd March 2016

Responses to the Consultation

Public Meetings

The attendance log for the St Bernadette's Primary Public Meeting lists a total of 58 attendees.

The breakdown of which is 17 Parents, 5 Staff, 10 Community representatives and 26 'Others'.

The attendance log for the Abercromby Primary Public Meeting lists a total of 42 attendees. The breakdown of which is 16 Parents, 11 Staff, 0 Community and 15 'Others'.

Feedback Forms were made available at both public meetings; those physical copies; received were added to those received electronically via the Council's online consultation system. A substantial amount of respondents responded via Clackmannanshire Council's online Consultation Database on Citizen Space. An analysis of the electronic submissions is shown under Public Consultation – Submissions.

A transcript of the oral representations made and the authority's responses are available on Clackmannanshire Council's website
<http://www.clacksweb.org.uk/site/documents/consultation/tullibodysouthcampusconsultationpublicmeetingtranscriptions/>

Summary of Pupil Consultation

A total of 412 responses were submitted by pupils at both schools.

299 (73%) expressed a preference for a Tullibody South Campus, with 113(27%) against the creation of a campus.

A total of 353 pupils submitted responses to the preferred site of a new campus. Of these 231 (65%) expressed a preference for Site A (existing Abercromby Primary School Site) and 122 (35%) expressed an interest in site B (Civic Centre Site).

Comment from pupils

A number of the pupils cited the size of the school, and the opportunities that this would create. These included having a bigger playground, the opportunity to make more friends and also to have access to more facilities.

"We are rebuilding the school because it is too small and if it is bigger more people can join and then more people will get good education."

"We will have a big school and I want to make new friends to play with."

"We will get a bigger playground to play in."

"..it will mean we get to make more friends."

"I'll meet my friends"

"I want to make more friends and more places to see for the school."

"Abercromby is quite old and it will be quite a change to have a different school."

There will be more space for two school and a large gym hall as it is bigger."

A number of the views on location mirrored the stated opinion of some respondents to the public consultation. They did not wish their school on the civic centre site as they enjoyed clubs that ran at the civic centre, they used the existing park or they liked the current location of the school.

"it is not fair to get rid of the park as it is fun"

"I think we should just make a school on the same bit."

"So we can keep the civic centre."

"I do not want the civic centre knocked down."

"I do not want to move, too much change."

"The park is a good place to have fun."

Public Consultation - Submissions

The consultation ran from 22/02/2016 to 22/04/2016. This report provides the summary results from the online consultation which was hosted on Clackmannanshire Council's online Citizen Space Consultation Database. All paper copies of the online survey submitted have been included in the analysis below.

Overall there were 438 responses to the public consultation survey. Not all questions were completed by each respondent and therefore for each question there are results denoted as 'not answered'.

For questions 3-5 (open ended questions) there are a significant number of comments. These have been themed for the purposes of analysis below but are provided in full at Appendices 1-3 of this report.

1) Name:

There were 322 responses to this question (**73.5%**)

2) Address:

There were 247 responses to this question (**56.4%**).

3) Postcode:

There were 381 responses to this questions (**87 %**). Of those providing a post code **65.6%** reside in Tullibody; **16.2%** reside elsewhere in Clackmannanshire and **3.1%** reside outwith Clackmannanshire. **14.9%** chose not to provide a postcode.

4) Gender:

There were 421 responses to this question (**96.1 %**). **35.8 %** were Males; **60.2 %** were Females and **3.8 %** chose not to answer.

5) Age:

There were 391 responses to this question (**89.3%**). The age groups for those who responded are below. The largest majority of respondents are within the 45-60 age group, closely followed by those in the 31-45 age group;

Table 1

Age Group	% of Response
<18 years	2.09%
18 - 30 years	10.47%
31 - 45 years	36.1%
46 - 60 years	36.3%
65+ years	14.9%

6) Religion:

There were 113 responses to this question (**25.8%**).

7) Active Interest or Role in Primary School:

There were 409 responses to this question (**93.4%**).

Table 2

Option	Number	%
Abercromby	152	41.19%
St Bernadette's	48	13.01%
None	149	40.38%
Not Answered	20	5.42%

Question 1: Do you support the development of a Tullibody South Campus?

There were 434 (99.1%) responses to this question. 81.3% responded yes and 17.8% responded no. Under 1% chose not to answer this question.

Question 2: If yes, which option do you prefer?

There were 383 responses to this question (87.4%).

78.8% prefer option A Building on the current Abercromby Site
 10.8% prefer option B Building on the Civic Centre Site
 10.3% chose not to answer the question.

The proportion of participants choosing option A and B by school is set out below:

Table 3

School	% Option A	% Option B	Did not Answer
Abercromby	87.13%	10.53%	2.3%
St Bernadette's	40.58%	8.6%	50.7%
No School	85.21%	9.4%	5.3%

Open Ended Questions - Summary of Results

If yes, why do you prefer your chosen option?

There were **256** responses to this part of the consultation.

Main themes from Question

- Save the park
- Preserve green space for children, families and those wanting to enjoy the outdoors - this fits with the health and wellbeing agenda.
- Option A allows residents to keep the park
- In this day and age schools should be multi-denominational and fully integrated
- Keep the school and park where they are
- Keep the Civic Centre for the community
- Option B would impair the park
- Option A would cause least disruption to education/families and residents
- An upgrade or replacement of Abercromby is necessary
- Visual representations of options would have been useful.

If no, what are your concerns?

There were **57** responses to this part of the consultation.

Main themes from Question

- Keep separate facilities – the school and civic centre have different purposes and should exist separately
- Findings from the information consultation seem to have been disregarded
- The park is well used – it needs to be kept for everyone to enjoy/use
- The civic centre is well used – it is important for Tullibody residents.
- Mixed/balanced views on joint campus for both schools – some in support of integration others concerned about the protecting the differences in both schools.
- Abercromby needs a new school but leave St Bernadettes where it is – it is fit for purpose
- Don't want large campus/school in Tullibody

Do you have any general comments or questions about the proposals?

There were **127** responses to this part of the consultation.

Main themes from Question

- Could the civic centre and park be taken into community ownership.
- What are the plans for traffic and parking and minimising disruption for local residents
- Concerns that green space will be lost for development in Tullibody
- The park should be improved for local residents
- Separate community facilities
- Feeling that this consultation does not fit with previous meetings, discussions and consultations on the school estate in Tullibody (ie no building on park ground) - confusion over the role of the informal and formal part of the consultation.
- Support the development of a new campus - need improved facilities and would encourage integration and closer communities.
- Need fit for purpose community facilities that are the right size for the community
- What are the plans for the sites of the old schools
- Keep the school and community separate.
- Keep the park.

Of the common questions or statements raised as written representations.

- What are the plans for traffic and parking and minimising disruption for local residents?

There will be opportunities for stakeholders to input into the traffic management plan at the design stage. In addition both schools will work on a travel plans as part of the planning application.

- Concerns that green space will be lost for development in Tullibody

The decision over vacated site/s will be made by Council as a separate process.

- Separate community facilities

At the design stage further discussions and work will be undertaken to identify the accommodation requirements for community use and timetabling.

- Feeling that this consultation does not fit with previous meetings, discussions and consultations on the school estate in Tullibody (ie no building on park ground) - confusion over the role of the informal and formal part of the consultation.

The Council has to work within the statutory process when it is undertaking the formal part of the consultation, this does not allow us the flexibility that we were able to have in the process prior to the formal consultation. Consultation over the design is not prescribed under legislation and will be informal.

- Support the development of a new campus - need improved facilities and would encourage integration and closer communities.

The design stage is key to getting the brief and specification of the facilities correct. Facilities will support closer integrating the delivery of services in line with council policy.

- Need fit for purpose community facilities that are the right size for the community

The council will explore the range of facilities that are available for the community including the facilities within the new campus.

- What are the plans for the sites of the old schools?

Sites that are not used to build the new campus on will be subject to a separate decision by the council as to their usage. This consultation did not consult on the future use of any vacated site.

- Keep the school and community separate. Keep the Park.

The council recognised the desire to retain public access to open space and took forward proposals that did not build on the park.

- Keep separate facilities – the school and civic centre have different purposes and should exist separately

As part of the consultation Council Officers have demonstrated how a campus with integrated facilities could work. This would give access to modern facilities to school and community users.

- Findings from the information consultation seem to have been disregarded

A decision was taken by the council on the option to take to public consultation, which was one of the options highlighted at the informal consultation. The initial consultation helped shape both the elements of the campus and potential sites.

- Mixed/balanced views on joint campus for both schools – some in support of integration others concerned about the protecting the differences in both schools.

The council has throughout the consultation highlighted that the identity and ethos of both schools will be protected, but also recognises that at present the schools share a community and work together. Sharing a campus will support joint working through the facilities of a campus, but respect the identities of the schools.

- Abercromby needs a new school but leave St Bernadette's where it is – it is fit for purpose

Abercromby is in the poorest condition rating, but the council believes that the campus provides wider benefits to the community and includes St Bernadette's within these developments. Providing a new build without both schools may lead to changes in migration between both schools, where new facilities are shown against the existing facilities at St Bernadette's. The council is committed to providing 21st century learning facilities across the council area.

- Don't want large campus/school in Tullibody

Forming a campus will create a state of the art learning environment: internally and externally with a holistic learning environment, from age 2 to 12. This will support a collaborative working environment for children and staff, giving enhanced opportunities for parents and carers to be involved in the life of the Schools and integrated community facilities which will support learning opportunities

As part of the statutory consultation process Education Scotland prepare a report on the consultation undertaken by Clackmannanshire Council. A copy of the Education Scotland Report is attached below and is also available on both the Education Scotland and Clackmannanshire Council website.

Report by Education Scotland addressing educational aspects of the proposal by Clackmannanshire Council to relocate education provision at Abercromby Primary School and St Bernadette's RC Primary School to a new campus in Tullibody South and to consult on the most appropriate site for the campus.

1. Introduction

This report from Education Scotland has been prepared by HM Inspectors in accordance with the terms of the *Schools (Consultation) (Scotland) Act 2010* and the amendments contained in the *Children and Young People (Scotland) Act 2014*. The purpose of the report is to provide an independent and impartial consideration of Clackmannanshire Council's proposal to relocate education provision at Abercromby Primary School and St Bernadette's RC Primary School to a new campus in Tullibody South and to consult on the most appropriate site for the campus. Section 2 of the report sets out brief details of the consultation process. Section 3 of the report sets out HM Inspectors' consideration of the educational aspects of the proposal, including significant views expressed by consultees. Section 4 summarises HM Inspectors' overall view of the proposal. Upon receipt of this report, the Act requires the council to consider it and then prepare its final consultation report. The council's final consultation report should include a copy of this report and must contain an explanation of how, in finalising the proposal, it has reviewed the initial proposal, including a summary of points raised during the consultation process and the council's response to them. The council has to publish its final consultation report three weeks before it takes its final decision. Where a council is proposing to close a school, it needs to follow all legislative obligations set out in the 2010 Act, including notifying Ministers within six working days of making its final decision and explaining to consultees the opportunity they have to make representations to Ministers.

1.1 HM Inspectors considered:

- the likely effects of the proposal for children and young people of the schools; any other users; children likely to become pupils within two years of the date of publication of the proposal paper; and other children and young people in the council area;
- any other likely effects of the proposal;
- how the council intends to minimise or avoid any adverse effects that may arise from the proposal; and
- the educational benefits the council believes will result from implementation of the proposal, and the council's reasons for coming to these beliefs.

1.2 In preparing this report, HM Inspectors undertook the following activities:

- attendance at the public meeting held on 15 March 2016 in connection with the council's proposals;

- consideration of all relevant documentation provided by the council in relation to the proposal, specifically the educational benefits statement and related consultation documents, written and oral submissions from parents and others; and
- visits to the site of Abercromby Primary School and Nursery Class and St Bernadette's RC Primary School, including discussion with relevant consultees.

2. Consultation Process

2.1 Clackmannanshire Council undertook the consultation on its proposal with reference to the *Schools (Consultation) (Scotland) Act 2010* and the amendments in the *Children and Young People (Scotland) Act 2014*.

2.2 Clackmannanshire Council undertook an informal consultation from 12 May to 3 July 2015 on three options in relation to a campus for Tullibody South. The analysis of responses led to the proposal to develop a campus incorporating Abercromby Primary School and Nursery Class, St Bernadette's RC Primary School and a Locality Hub which would integrate existing public services onto one site. Two alternative site options emerged from the informal consultation. Option A: a new Tullibody South Campus within the grounds of the present Abercromby Primary School and Option B: a new Tullibody South campus located within the grounds of the present Tullibody Civic Centre.

2.3 The statutory consultation ran from 22 February to 22 April 2016. Notices about the proposal were placed on the council's website and copies of the proposal were widely available to stakeholders. Children attending Abercromby and St Bernadette's RC Primary Schools were given good opportunities to give their views. As part of its consultation arrangements the council held public meetings on 15 March 2016 in St Bernadette's RC Primary School and 22 March 2016 in Abercromby Primary School.

2.4 The council received 438 responses to its proposal of which 81.8% were in favour of a Tullibody South Campus. In response to the question regarding which site option they preferred, 81.3% of those who responded were in favour of Option A, 10.8% preferred Option B and 10.3% chose not to answer the question.

2.5 The written submission from the Diocese of Dunkeld indicated that in principle it would support the creation of a joint campus provided the council adhered to the conditions and assurances laid down by the Bishops Conference of Scotland.

3. Educational Aspects of Proposal

3.1 This proposal offers clear educational benefits for the children of Tullibody South. As a result of the proposal, children will have access to modern school buildings which offer a range of flexible learning spaces and fully equipped to deliver Curriculum for Excellence. The council's proposal will ensure each school retains its own separate identity while offering many opportunities to work and learn together on the one campus. It will be easier for staff from both schools to work together and to use these opportunities to develop further the curriculum and learning. The proposal has the potential to strengthen community links which already exist between the schools, the church and the various groups which access the Tullibody Civic Centre and Heritage Centre.

3.2 Most of the stakeholders who met with HM Inspectors supported the proposal and agreed that the children needed more modern school accommodation and improved outdoor sporting facilities. Almost all children who met with HM Inspectors viewed the proposal positively. They were keen to help design a new school that would include a large outdoor space where they could play and take part in a wider range of outdoor activities.

3.3 The few stakeholders who oppose the proposal were more focused on the possible loss of a community resource and were seeking assurance from the council that community groups and the Heritage Centre would be protected should the proposal go ahead. In taking this proposal forward the council should reassure stakeholders that it will, as outlined in the consultation documentation, involve them fully in the design and other aspects of the development of the campus.

4. Summary

Clackmannanshire Council's proposal to relocate educational provision at Abercromby Primary School and St Bernadette's RC Primary School to a new campus in Tullibody South on the most appropriate site has clear educational benefits. The proposal has the potential to provide the children with a high-quality learning environment. In taking this proposal forward, the council should continue, as planned, to fully involve all stakeholders, including the Diocese of Dunkeld and community groups, in the design process for the new school accommodation.

HM Inspectors
Education Scotland
April 2016

Statement on how Clackmannanshire Council has complied with the Education Scotland Report.

In reviewing the Education Scotland Report, Clackmannanshire Council will:-

- Continue to involve stakeholders in the design process of the new Tullibody South Campus.
- Work with both schools to design the outdoor space at the new school.

Next Stages

Following the publication of this report, Clackmannanshire Council requires to allow time for further consideration. This requires three weeks to lapse before taking a final decision on whether to implement a final proposal. A decision on this consultation is due to be taken by Clackmannanshire Council on 11th August 2016.



**Clackmannanshire
Council**

www.clacksweb.org.uk