
Report to Council

Date of Meeting: 5th March 2015

Subject: Abercromby Primary School Development – Option Appraisal

Report by: Head of Education

1.0 Purpose

The report sets out to inform members of the results of the initial Abercromby Primary School options appraisal exercise and seeks Council's permission for the Education service to carry out informal public consultation on three of the appraised options.

2.0 Recommendations

- 2.1** It is recommended that the Council agrees to undertake public consultation in relation to appraisal options **5,7&9** for a new school(s) including the option to include civic centre provision on the site of the existing civic centre and adjoining land.

3.0 Considerations

- 3.1** The ongoing review of the school estate identified that Abercromby Primary School is the school in Clackmannanshire which is in the poorest condition, has the lowest suitability rating and has issues in terms of capacity.
- 3.2** The Scottish Government's Schools for The Future Programme has offered funding for a refurbishment or rebuild of Abercromby Primary School.
- 3.3.** The Education Service was asked to carry out an options appraisal for the refurbishment and redevelopment of Abercromby Primary School, including the integration of community facilities. Nine options were considered. Business cases were produced for each of these options. The appendix to this report contains these options.
- 3.4** The business cases which have been developed suggest that three of these options have significant advantages over the others. These options are for a new build of:-
- 3.4.1** Abercromby Primary School with associated community facilities.
- 3.4.2** A shared campus for Abercromby Primary School and St Bernadette's Primary with associated community facilities.

3.4.3 A shared campus of Abercromby Primary School and a combined St Bernadette's and St Mungo's Primary school with associated community facilities.

3.5 Denominational provision, which would operate as a separate school maintaining a distinct identity within a wider campus facility, has been included within the option appraisals based on the following four factors:-

3.5.1 Geographical location with St Bernadette's being located less than half a mile from Abercromby Primary school.

3.5.2 Educational benefits, the opportunity to enhance learning and teaching by providing access 21st century learning facilities.

3.5.3 The ability to deliver a full 3-12 educational provision to the denominational sector in line with Clackmannanshire policy. This is currently unavailable at both St Bernadette's and St Mungo's.

3.5.4 The educational benefits of being able to share best practice and conduct staff development on a larger scale.

3.6 The inclusion of community facilities would allow a holistic service to be provided for children, families and the wider community of Tullibody in a single location.

4.0 Sustainability Implications

4.1. The Scottish Government requires all new school developments to be carried out with regard to the following principles:-

4.1.1 To have regard for others who do not have access to the same levels of resources.

4.1.2 To minimise the impact of actions on future generations by reducing the use of resources and minimising environmental impacts.

4.1.3 To live within the capacity of the planet to sustain our activities and replenish resources we use.

4.2. A key objective of the schools estate strategy is that new schools should demonstrate commitment to the highest design and environmental standards.

4.3. The designs of any of the proposed options would, therefore, require to be consistent with current sustainability criteria.

5.0 Resource Implications

5.1 The full financial implications of the recommendations are set out in the report. This includes a reference to full life cycle costs where appropriate.

5.2 Finance have been consulted and have agreed the financial implications as set out in the report.

5.3 It is envisaged that further revenue savings could be achieved by the co-location of school(s) and community facilities.

6.0 Exempt Reports

6.1 Is this report exempt? **No**

7.0 Declarations

(1) **Our Priorities** (Please double click on the check box ☒)

| | |
|--|--------------------------|
| The area has a positive image and attracts people and businesses | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| Our communities are more cohesive and inclusive | √ |
| People are better skilled, trained and ready for learning and employment | √ |
| Our communities are safer | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| Vulnerable people and families are supported | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| Substance misuse and its effects are reduced | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| Health is improving and health inequalities are reducing | √ |
| The environment is protected and enhanced for all | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| The Council is effective, efficient and recognised for excellence | √ |

(2) **Council Policies** Please detail)

Making Clackmannanshire Better
3-12 Education Provision

8.0 Equalities Impact

8.1 Have you undertaken the required equalities impact assessment to ensure that no groups are adversely affected by the recommendations?

Yes ☒ No

9.0 Legality

9.1 It has been confirmed that in adopting the recommendations contained in this report, the Council is acting within its legal powers.

Yes ☒

10.0 Appendices

10.1 Appendix 1 – Refurbishment/Replacement of Abercromby Primary School –
Summary of Feasibility Studies

11.0 Background Papers

11.1 None

Author(s)

| NAME | DESIGNATION | TEL NO / EXTENSION |
|-------------|--------------------|---------------------------|
| Iain McGhee | Education Officer | 01786 233944 |

Approved by

| NAME | DESIGNATION | SIGNATURE |
|------------------|--------------------|--------------------------|
| David Leng | Head of Education | Signed: David Leng |
| Elaine McPherson | Chief Executive | Signed: Elaine McPherson |

Refurbishment/Replacement of Abercromby Primary School Summary of Feasibility Studies



1.1 Introduction

The Scottish Government made an offer of partial funding for a refurbishment or replacement of Abercromby Primary School. The Education Sport and Leisure Committee authorised the Education Service to conduct an option appraisal for this project including examining a community hub approach.

2.1 Option Appraisals

Four overarching options were considered in relation to this exercise; these were

Stand Alone

- Do minimum
- Full refurbishment

Combined

- Remodel and extend
- New build

This resulted in nine options being examined in more detail:-

1. Carry on with present programme of work to ensure that Abercromby Primary School and the Civic Centre remain in a 'B' condition.
2. Refurbish Abercromby Primary School and the Civic Centre
3. Redevelop Abercromby Primary School with associated community facilities
4. Build a new Abercromby Primary School on a new site.
5. Build a new Abercromby Primary School on a new site School with associated community facilities
6. Build a new Abercromby Primary School and St Bernadette's on a new joint campus.

7. Build a new Abercromby Primary School and St Bernadette's on a new joint campus School with associated community facilities
8. Build a new Abercromby Primary School and a merged St Bernadette's/St Mungo's on a new joint campus.
9. Build a new Abercromby Primary School and St Bernadette's and St Mungo's on a new joint campus with School with associated community facilities.

2.2. In line with the Making Clackmannanshire Better Policy and the precedent set by the Redwell development the potential for the rationalisation of the wider school estate in Tullibody was examined. The option to examine the possibility of rationalising the school estate by merging either St Serf's or Banchory Primary School with Abercromby was immediately discounted on educational grounds with the resulting school projected to have a roll of well over six hundred pupils. A school of this size could potentially lose the intimacy and personalisation of education that is so important in Primary Schools. The opportunity to build a new St Bernadette's (which would continue to operate as a separate school maintaining a distinct identity) on a joint campus was seen as having potential educational and financial benefits. The chance to improve the educational opportunities for the wider denominational community by including St Mungo's as a potential partner in this process was also therefore included.

2.3 The option to build a new school on the existing site was deemed to be too disruptive and problematic, with no alternative accommodation available to decant pupils to during the building phase.

3.1 Summary of the Option Appraisals

Options were appraised using a combination of non financial considerations (largely educational), financial considerations and value for money. A summary table is included at the end of this document

which sets out these ratings and the financial costs of each potential option.

3.2. *Option 1 - Carry on with present programme of work to ensure that Abercromby Primary School and the Civic Centre remains in a 'B' condition.*

Advantages

- Limited capital investment required
- Will cause limited disruption to teaching and learning.
- Will cause limited disruption to community use of facilities

Disadvantages

- Does nothing to improve the educational experience of the children attending Abercromby Primary School.
- Does nothing to alleviate the issues in relation to capacity for the school.
- Does not improve community facilities
- Does not qualify for Scottish Government funding.
- Offers little value for money.

| Non-financial Appraisal Criteria | | Weighting | Score (1/10) | Weighted score |
|----------------------------------|--|------------|--------------|----------------|
| 1 | Enabling services to be shaped to meet local need | 15 | 3 | 45 |
| 2 | Achieving best use of shared resources to meet local needs | 15 | 3 | 45 |
| 3 | Contribution to improving public experience of services received | 15 | 3 | 45 |
| 4 | Opportunities to work jointly to improve services | 15 | 3 | 45 |
| 5 | Physical capacity to meet future educational and nursery demand | 10 | 4 | 40 |
| 6 | Flexibility to adapt to changing future demand and needs | 5 | 3 | 15 |
| 7 | Accommodation that is modern and fit for future purpose | 10 | 4 | 40 |
| 8 | Longer term sustainability of building form and structure | 5 | 3 | 15 |
| 9 | Improving energy efficiency / EPC rating | 5 | 4 | 20 |
| 10 | Minimising disruption to education delivery and services | 5 | 5 | 25 |
| Totals | | 100 | 355 | |

| Gross Internal Floor area (GIFA) | Capital Costs | Whole life costs 12 years only | Financial Rating i.e. Whole life costs per m ² |
|-------------------------------------|---------------|-----------------------------------|--|
| 4,930 | 6,468,368 | 9 293 830* | 157 |

| Non Financial rating | Financial rating | Value for Money |
|----------------------|------------------|-----------------|
| 355 | 157 | 2.26 |

Option 2 - Refurbish Abercromby Primary School and the Civic Centre

Advantages

- Costs reduced
- Capacity issues addressed
- Educational suitability improved
- Community facilities improved

Disadvantages

- Major disruption to learning and teaching over an extended period of time.
- Considerable sums will require to be spent on temporary accommodation.
- Overall suitability; whilst a refurbishment will improve overall suitability, it will not make the educational experience enjoyed by Abercromby Primary School pupils anywhere near a comparable level to counterparts at Redwell Primary School.
- Major disruption to Community facilities
- Duplication of resources in Tullibody

| Non-financial Appraisal Criteria | Weighting | Score 1-10 | Weighted Score |
|---|-----------|------------|----------------|
| 1. Enabling services to be shaped to meet local need | 15 | 5 | 75 |
| 2. Achieving best use of shared resources to meet local needs | 15 | 4 | 60 |
| 3. Contribution to improving public experience of services received | 15 | 5 | 75 |
| 4. Opportunities to work jointly to improve services | 15 | 4 | 60 |
| 5. Physical capacity to meet future educational and nursery demand | 10 | 7 | 70 |
| 6. Flexibility to adapt to changing future demand and needs | 5 | 5 | 25 |
| 7. Accommodation that is modern and fit for future purpose | 10 | 7 | 70 |
| 8. Longer term sustainability of building form and structure | 5 | 4 | 20 |

| | | | |
|--|-----|------------|----|
| 9. Improving energy efficiency / EPC rating | 5 | 6 | 30 |
| 10. Minimising disruption to education delivery and services | 5 | 4 | 20 |
| Totals | 100 | 505 | |

| Gross Internal Floor area (GIFA) | Capital Costs | Whole life costs | Financial Rating i.e. Whole life costs per m ² |
|----------------------------------|---------------|------------------|--|
| 5,640 | 10,738.845 | 15 575 447* | 92 |

| Non Financial rating | Financial rating | Value for Money |
|----------------------|------------------|-----------------|
| 505 | 92 | 5.49 |

1. *Option 3 - Redevelop Abercromby Primary School* with associated community facilities

Advantages

- Retention of all outdoors sports facilities on the Civic Centre site.
- Existing building fabric, services and fittings brought up to current standard.
- Able to provide a more holistic service to children and families in the community.
- Civic Centre remains operational throughout.

Disadvantages

- Would allow for only a partial upgrade of learning facilities.
- Would disrupt learning and teaching whilst upgrade and new building takes place.
- Temporary accommodation would have to be put on site to allow for pupils to be decanted during building works.
- Changing facilities would be disconnected from the playing fields

| Non-financial Appraisal Criteria | Weighting | Score 1-10 | Weighted Score |
|---|------------|------------|----------------|
| 1. Enabling services to be shaped to meet local need | 15 | 7 | 105 |
| 2. Achieving best use of shared resources to meet local needs | 15 | 6 | 90 |
| 3. Contribution to improving public experience of services received | 15 | 7 | 105 |
| 4. Opportunities to work jointly to improve services | 15 | 7 | 95 |
| 5. Physical capacity to meet future educational and nursery demand | 10 | 7 | 70 |
| 6. Flexibility to adapt to changing future demand and needs | 5 | 6 | 30 |
| 7. Accommodation that is modern and fit for future purpose | 10 | 8 | 80 |
| 8. Longer term sustainability of building form and structure | 5 | 6 | 30 |
| 9. Improving energy efficiency / EPC rating | 5 | 7 | 35 |
| 10. Minimising disruption to education delivery and services | 5 | 4 | 20 |
| Totals | 100 | | 670 |

| Gross Internal Floor area (GIFA) | Capital Costs | Whole life costs | Financial Rating i.e. Whole life costs per m ² |
|----------------------------------|---------------|------------------|---|
| 5 088 | 10 387 678 | 14 750 911 | 97 |

| Non Financial rating | Financial rating | Value for Money |
|----------------------|------------------|-----------------|
| 670 | 97 | 6.91 |

Option 4 - Build a new Abercromby Primary School on a new site.

Advantages

- Pupils will have access to excellent 21st century learning facilities.
- Abercromby Primary School will remain fully operational throughout the building period with no disruption to teaching and learning.
- All facilities created to comply with current building regulations and environmental and sustainability standards.
- New building is easier to maintain than existing estate
- External sports facilities on the same site as the Primary School
- Primary School site becomes available for reuse.

Disadvantages

- Potential loss of one grass football pitch if not reinstated on current Abercromby site.
- Breaks the stakeholder attachment to the current building.

| Non-financial Appraisal Criteria | Weighting | Score 1-10 | Weighted Score |
|---|------------|------------|----------------|
| 1. Enabling services to be shaped to meet local need | 15 | 7 | 105 |
| 2. Achieving best use of shared resources to meet local needs | 15 | 7 | 105 |
| 3. Contribution to improving public experience of services received | 15 | 8 | 120 |
| 4. Opportunities to work jointly to improve services | 15 | 7 | 105 |
| 5. Physical capacity to meet future educational and nursery demand | 10 | 10 | 100 |
| 6. Flexibility to adapt to changing future demand and needs | 5 | 8 | 40 |
| 7. Accommodation that is modern and fit for future purpose | 10 | 10 | 100 |
| 8. Longer term sustainability of building form and structure | 5 | 9 | 45 |
| 9. Improving energy efficiency / EPC rating | 5 | 9 | 45 |
| 10. Minimising disruption to education delivery and services | 5 | 9 | 45 |
| Totals | 100 | 810 | |

| Gross Internal Floor area m ² (GIFA) | Capital Costs | Whole life costs | Financial Rating i.e. Whole life costs per m ² |
|--|---------------|------------------|--|
| 3749 | 9 736 1530 | 14 405 920 | 128 |

| Non Financial rating | Financial rating | Value for Money |
|----------------------|------------------|-----------------|
| 810 | 128 | 6.33 |

1. *Option 5 - Build a new Abercromby Primary School* with associated community facilities

Advantages

- Pupils will have access to excellent 21st century learning facilities.
- Both Abercromby Primary School and the Civic Centre will remain fully operational throughout the building period.
- All facilities created to comply with current building regulations and environmental and sustainability standards.
- New buildings are easier to maintain than existing estate
- External sports facilities on the same site as the Primary School
- The community are able to access a wider range of services on the one site.
- Potential educational advantages of closer home/school/community links providing a holistic service for children and families.
- Primary School site becomes available for reuse.

Disadvantages

- Potential loss of one grass football pitch if not reinstated on current Abercromby site
- Breaks the stakeholder attachment to the current buildings.

| Non-financial Appraisal Criteria | Weighting | Score 1-10 | Weighted Score |
|---|------------|------------|----------------|
| 1. Enabling services to be shaped to meet local need | 15 | 9 | 135 |
| 2. Achieving best use of shared resources to meet local needs | 15 | 9 | 135 |
| 3. Contribution to improving public experience of services received | 15 | 9 | 135 |
| 4. Opportunities to work jointly to improve services | 15 | 9 | 135 |
| 5. Physical capacity to meet future educational and nursery demand | 10 | 9 | 90 |
| 6. Flexibility to adapt to changing future demand and needs | 5 | 8 | 40 |
| 7. Accommodation that is modern and fit for future purpose | 10 | 10 | 100 |
| 8. Longer term sustainability of building form and structure | 5 | 9 | 45 |
| 9. Improving energy efficiency / EPC rating | 5 | 9 | 45 |
| 10. Minimising disruption to education delivery and services | 5 | 8 | 40 |
| Totals | 100 | 900 | |

| Gross Internal Floor area (GIFA) | Capital Costs | Whole life costs | Financial Rating i.e. Whole life costs per m² |
|----------------------------------|---------------|------------------|---|
| 4 967 | 12 550 165 | 16 218 467 | 109 |

| Non Financial rating | Financial rating | Value for Money |
|----------------------|------------------|-----------------|
| 900 | 109 | 8.26 |

Option 6 - Build a new Abercromby Primary School and St Bernadette's on a new joint campus.

Advantages

- A larger number of pupils will have access to excellent 21st century learning facilities.
- Both Abercromby Primary School, St Bernadette's Primary School will remain fully operational throughout the building period.
- The parents of children at St Bernadette's will have access to Nursery facilities on the same site. Transition from Nursery to primary will therefore be much easier. This facility is currently unavailable to parents of St Bernadette's children.
- Children at St Bernadette's will have access to a wider range of educational facilities in a large campus than would ever be available in St Bernadette's.
- There would be opportunities created for joint projects and working collaboratively across both schools thereby enhancing the educational opportunities for children and the professional development opportunities for staff.
- The links between St Bernadette's and the local Parish would be retained.
- Potential educational/social advantages of being able to develop closer home/school/community links thereby providing a holistic service for children and families.
- All facilities created to comply with current building regulations and environmental and sustainability standards.
- New buildings are easier to maintain than existing estate
- External sports facilities on the same site as the Primary School
- Both Primary School sites become available for reuse.

Disadvantages

- Requires careful planning to ensure that St Bernadette's does not lose it's identity as a separate denominational school.

- The school would move slightly further away from the Parish Church.
- Potential loss of one grass football pitch if not reinstated on current Abercromby site.
- Breaks the stakeholder attachment to the current buildings.

| Non-financial Appraisal Criteria | Weighting | Score 1-10 | Weighted Score |
|---|------------|------------|----------------|
| 1. Enabling services to be shaped to meet local need | 15 | 7 | 105 |
| 2. Achieving best use of shared resources to meet local needs | 15 | 7 | 105 |
| 3. Contribution to improving public experience of services received | 15 | 8 | 120 |
| 4. Opportunities to work jointly to improve services | 15 | 8 | 120 |
| 5. Physical capacity to meet future educational and nursery demand | 10 | 9 | 90 |
| 6. Flexibility to adapt to changing future demand and needs | 5 | 9 | 40 |
| 7. Accommodation that is modern and fit for future purpose | 10 | 10 | 100 |
| 8. Longer term sustainability of building form and structure | 5 | 9 | 45 |
| 9. Improving energy efficiency / EPC rating | 5 | 9 | 45 |
| 10. Minimising disruption to education delivery and services | 5 | 8 | 40 |
| Totals | 100 | 810 | |

| Gross Internal Floor area (GIFA) | Capital Costs | Whole life costs | Financial Rating i.e. Whole life costs per m ² |
|----------------------------------|---------------|------------------|---|
| 6113 | 15 873 668 | 21 158 893 | 115 |

| Non Financial rating | Financial rating | Value for Money |
|----------------------|------------------|-----------------|
| 810 | 115 | 7.04 |

1. *Option 7 - Build a new Abercromby Primary School and St Bernadette's on a new joint campus* School with associated community facilities.

Advantages

- A larger number of pupils will have access to excellent 21st century learning facilities.
- Both Abercromby Primary School, St Bernadette's Primary School and the Civic centre will remain fully operational throughout the building period.
- The parents of children at St Bernadette's will have access to Nursery facilities on the same site. Transition from Nursery to primary will therefore be much easier. This facility is currently unavailable to parents of St Bernadette's children.
- Children at St Bernadette's will have access to a wider range of educational facilities in a large campus than would ever be available in St Bernadette's.
- There would be opportunities created for joint projects and working collaboratively across both schools thereby enhancing the educational opportunities for children and the professional development opportunities for staff.
- The links between St Bernadette's and the local Parish would be retained.
- Potential educational/social advantages of being able to develop closer home/school/community links thus providing a holistic service for children and families.
- All facilities created to comply with current building regulations and environmental and sustainability standards.
- New buildings are easier to maintain than existing estate
- External sports facilities on the same site as the Primary School
- The community are able to access a wider range of services on the one site.
- Offers potential saving in administrative staffing.

Disadvantages

- Requires careful planning to ensure that St Bernadette's does not lose it's identity as a separate denominational school.
- The school would move slightly further away from the Parish Church.
- Potential loss of one grass football pitch if not reinstated on current Abercromby site.
- Breaks the stakeholder attachment to the current buildings.

Non Financial rating

| Non-financial Appraisal Criteria | Weighting | Score 1-10 | Weighted Score |
|---|------------|------------|----------------|
| 1. Enabling services to be shaped to meet local need | 15 | 9 | 135 |
| 2. Achieving best use of shared resources to meet local needs | 15 | 9 | 135 |
| 3. Contribution to improving public experience of services received | 15 | 9 | 135 |
| 4. Opportunities to work jointly to improve services | 15 | 9 | 135 |
| 5. Physical capacity to meet future educational and nursery demand | 10 | 9 | 90 |
| 6. Flexibility to adapt to changing future demand and needs | 5 | 8 | 40 |
| 7. Accommodation that is modern and fit for future purpose | 10 | 10 | 100 |
| 8. Longer term sustainability of building form and structure | 5 | 9 | 45 |
| 9. Improving energy efficiency / EPC rating | 5 | 9 | 45 |
| 10. Minimising disruption to education delivery and services | 5 | 9 | 45 |
| Totals | 100 | 905 | |

Financial Rating

| Gross Internal Floor area (GIFA) | Capital Costs | Whole life costs | Financial Rating i.e. Whole life costs per m ² |
|----------------------------------|---------------|------------------|---|
| 6713 | 17 415 208 | 23 171 966 | 115 |

Overall Rating

| Non Financial rating | Financial rating | Value for Money |
|----------------------|------------------|-----------------|
| 905 | 115 | 7.87 |

Option 8 - Build a new Abercromby Primary School and a merged St Bernadette's/St Mungo's on a new joint campus.

Advantages

- A larger number of pupils will have access to excellent 21st century learning facilities.
- Including St Mungo's pupils would ensure that all denominational children have equal access to a full range of high quality 21st century learning facilities.
- Both Abercromby Primary School, St Bernadette's Primary School , St Mungo's Primary School will remain fully operational throughout the building period.
- The parents of children at St Bernadette's and St Mungo's will have access to Nursery facilities on the same site. Transition from Nursery to primary will therefore be much easier. This facility is currently unavailable to parents of both St Bernadette's and St Mungo's children.
- Children at St Bernadette's and St Mungo's will have access to a wider range of educational facilities in a large campus than would ever be available in either St Bernadette's or St Mungo's.
- The new merged denominational school would offer full age and stage provision.
- The new merged school would offer wider educational opportunities for children and the potential for increased practice sharing thereby supporting the professional development of staff.
- The new merged school would be much closer in size to Abercromby Primary School thereby reducing potential anxieties about lost identity.
- The new merged school would aid recruitment and retention of senior staff.
- A larger denominational school offering a full range of age and stage provision with access to a wider range of facilities may be a more attractive option for denominational parents who do not currently send their children to a denominational school.
- A merged school would offer revenue savings in terms of staffing.

- There would be opportunities created for joint projects and working collaboratively across both schools thereby enhancing the educational opportunities for children and the professional development opportunities for staff.
- All facilities created to comply with current building regulations and environmental and sustainability standards.
- New buildings are easier to maintain than existing estate
- External sports facilities on the same site as the Primary School
- Three primary school sites become available for reuse.

Disadvantages

- Increased travelling time to school for some St Mungo's pupils.
- Potential transport costs bringing denominational pupils to the school from across Clackmannanshire.
- The link between St Mungo's and its Parish would be lost.
- Potential loss of one grass football pitch if not reinstated on current Abercromby site.
- Breaks the stakeholder attachment to the current buildings.

| Non-financial Appraisal Criteria | Weighting | Score 1-10 | Weighted Score |
|---|------------|------------|----------------|
| 1. Enabling services to be shaped to meet local need | 15 | 7 | 105 |
| 2. Achieving best use of shared resources to meet local needs | 15 | 8 | 120 |
| 3. Contribution to improving public experience of services received | 15 | 8 | 120 |
| 4. Opportunities to work jointly to improve services | 15 | 8 | 120 |
| 5. Physical capacity to meet future educational and nursery demand | 10 | 9 | 90 |
| 6. Flexibility to adapt to changing future demand and needs | 5 | 9 | 40 |
| 7. Accommodation that is modern and fit for future purpose | 10 | 10 | 100 |
| 8. Longer term sustainability of building form and structure | 5 | 9 | 45 |
| 9. Improving energy efficiency / EPC rating | 5 | 9 | 45 |
| 10. Minimising disruption to education delivery and services | 5 | 8 | 40 |
| Totals | 100 | 825 | |

Financial Rating

| Gross Internal Floor area (GIFA) | Capital Costs | Whole life costs | Financial Rating i.e. Whole life costs per m ² |
|----------------------------------|---------------|------------------|---|
| 6455 | 16 761 742 | 22 269 750 | 115 |

Overall Rating

| Non Financial rating | Financial rating | Value for Money |
|----------------------|------------------|-----------------|
| 825 | 115 | 7.17 |

- Option 9 - Build a new Abercromby Primary School and St Bernadette's and St Mungo's on a new joint campus with associated community facilities.*

Advantages

- A larger number of pupils will have access to excellent 21st century learning facilities.
- Including St Mungo's pupils would ensure that all denominational children have equal access to a full range of high quality 21st century learning facilities.
- Both Abercromby Primary School, St Bernadette's Primary School, St Mungo's Primary school and the Civic centre will remain fully operational throughout the building period.
- The parents of children at St Bernadette's and St Mungo's will have access to Nursery facilities on the same site. Transition from Nursery to primary will therefore be much easier. This facility is currently unavailable to parents of both St Bernadette's and St Mungo's children.
- Children at St Bernadette's and St Mungo's will have access to a wider range of educational facilities in a large campus than would ever be available in either St Bernadette's or St Mungo's.
- The new merged denominational school would offer full age and stage provision.

- The new merged school would offer wider educational opportunities for children and the potential for increased practice sharing thereby aiding the professional development of staff.
- The new merged school would be much closer in size to Abercromby Primary School thereby reducing potential anxieties about lost identity.
- The new merged school would aid recruitment and retention of senior staff.
- A merged school would offer revenue savings in terms of staffing.
- There would be opportunities created for joint projects and working collaboratively across both schools thereby enhancing the educational opportunities for children and the professional development opportunities for staff.
- Potential educational/social advantages of being able to develop closer home/school/community links and thus providing a holistic service for children and families.
- All facilities created to comply with current building regulations and environmental and sustainability standards.
- New buildings are easier to maintain than existing estate
- External sports facilities on the same site as the Primary School.
- Three primary school sites become available for reuse.
- The community are able to access a wider range of services on the one site.
- Potential educational advantages of closer home/school/community links.
- May mean wider access to community facilities with a larger pool of parents accessing the site.

Disadvantages

- Increased travelling time to school for some St Mungo's pupils.
- Potential transport costs bringing denominational pupils to the school from across Clackmannanshire.
- The link between St Mungo's and it's Parish would be lost.
- Potential loss of one grass football pitch if not reinstated on current Abercromby site.
- Breaks the stakeholder attachment to the current building.

Non Financial Rating

| Non-financial Appraisal Criteria | Weighting | Score 1-10 | Weighted Score |
|---|------------|------------|----------------|
| 1. Enabling services to be shaped to meet local need | 15 | 9 | 135 |
| 2. Achieving best use of shared resources to meet local needs | 15 | 9 | 135 |
| 3. Contribution to improving public experience of services received | 15 | 9 | 135 |
| 4. Opportunities to work jointly to improve services | 15 | 10 | 150 |
| 5. Physical capacity to meet future educational and nursery demand | 10 | 9 | 90 |
| 6. Flexibility to adapt to changing future demand and needs | 5 | 9 | 45 |
| 7. Accommodation that is modern and fit for future purpose | 10 | 10 | 100 |
| 8. Longer term sustainability of building form and structure | 5 | 9 | 45 |
| 9. Improving energy efficiency / EPC rating | 5 | 9 | 45 |
| 10. Minimising disruption to education delivery and services | 5 | 9 | 45 |
| Totals | 100 | 925 | |

Financial Rating

| Gross Internal Floor area m ² (GIFA) | Capital Costs | Whole life costs | Financial Rating i.e. Whole life costs per m ² |
|---|---------------|------------------|---|
| 7055 | 18 293 876 | 24 343 916 | 115 |

Overall Rating

| Non Financial rating | Financial rating | Value for Money |
|----------------------|------------------|-----------------|
| 925 | 115 | 8.04 |

4.1 Summary Table

| Options | | Non Financial | Financial | VFM |
|---------|--|------------------|-----------|-------------|
| 1. | Carry on with present programme of work to ensure that Abercromby Primary School and the Civic Centre remains in a 'B' condition. | 355 | 157 | 2.26 |
| 2. | Refurbish Abercromby Primary School and refurbish the Civic Centre | 505 | 92 | 5.49 |
| 3 | Redevelop Abercromby Primary School with associated community facilities | 670 | 97 | 6.91 |
| 4 | Build a new Abercromby Primary School on a new site. | 810 | 128 | 6.33 |
| 5 | Build a new Abercromby Primary School on a new site with associated community facilities | 900 | 109 | 8.26 |
| 6. | Build a new Abercromby Primary School and St Bernadette's on a new joint campus. | 810 | 115 | 7.04 |
| 7 | Build a new Abercromby Primary School and St Bernadette's on a new joint campus with associated community facilities. | 905 | 115 | 7.87 |
| 8 | Build a new Abercromby Primary School and a merged St Bernadette's/St Mungo's on a new joint campus. | 825 | 115 | 7.17 |
| 9. | Build a new Abercromby Primary School and St Bernadette's and St Mungo's on new joint campus with associated community facilities. | 925 | 115 | 8.04 |

Recommendations:

Consultation on the following options should be undertake as early as possible (March 2015):

- Build a new Abercromby Primary School on a new site with associated community facilities
- Build a new Abercromby Primary School and St Bernadette's on a new joint campus with associated community facilities
- Build a new Abercromby Primary School and St Bernadette's and St Mungo's on a new joint campus with associated community facilities.